

NOTES
ON
CHURCH'S
Trial & Death of Socrates

BY
S. N. NARAHARAYYA, B.A. (LANG.),
EDITOR OF SCOTT'S LAY OF THE LAST
MINSTREL WITH NOTES, &C.

Drink now, O Socrates, in the realms of Jove,
For truly did the God pronounce you wise,
And who said so is himself all wisdom :
You drank the poison which your country gave ;
But they drank wisdom from your godlike voice.

ALLAHABAD :
RAM DAYAL AGARWALA,
1912.

Price Rs. 1-8-0.

PRINTED BY PANDIT JANKI NATH SHARGA AT THE "LEADER PRESS,"
ALLAHABAD.

PREFACE.

An attempt is made in these pages—as much as the space permits—to give as much information as is necessary to understand the text book well. It must be observed that in such works as “The Trial and Death of Socrates” more attention is to be paid to the thought than to the words. In fact, the work is written in the most easy style, and a student may not require the use of a dictionary every now and then. Nevertheless, in trying to give an account of a philosopher with whom wrong use of words was not only a fault in itself but also creating of an evil in the soul, words used have naturally a special significance. That should be kept in view, and it is believed that the derivations here given, and also the history of certain words, would be welcome. Classical allusions and references have been given as far as they were deemed necessary, and the introduction is an attempt to give a short account of—

- (1) Socrates and his habits.
- (2) philosophy, and,
- (3) the constitution of the Athenian law courts.

Before the text book is begun to be studied, these facts may be learnt with advantage. At the beginning of each book a brief summary is given, the idea there being that a knowledge of broad facts helps to a better study of the details. To excite logical curiosity, certain facts have been given in an analytical form. Attention of the readers is drawn here and there to important facts, and certain grammatical peculiarities have also been explained. The other merits will, of course, become plain as the book is used.

ALLAHABAD: }
June 1902. }

S. N. N.

INTRODUCTION

Socrates was born, according to one account, in Ol. 77. 4 (B. C. 468), and in 469 B. C., according to another, at Athens, (and as some say, in a village near Athens.) His father, Sophroniscus, was a sculptor, and his mother, Phænarete, a midwife. He was originally destined for his father's profession, and it is said that he made no slight proficiency in that art. Statues of the Graces clothed in flowing drapery were exhibited in the Æcropolis as his work. He did not devote himself to the profession. Only he carried it on as much as to earn a decent subsistence by it. While still engaged in statuary, he spent a great part of his time in reading all the accessory works of the former and contemporary philosophers. Crito, who remained his friend to the very last, supplied him with money to pay the masters who taught him the various accomplishments in Athens. He had in fact received the very best education which an Athenian could command in those days.

There are two phases with regard to his public life,—as a soldier, and as a member of the Boule ('deliberative senate'). During the Peloponnesian war, he made three several campaigns :

432-29. He served as a hoplite ('heavy armed soldier') at Potidæa.

424. He served at Delium.

422. He served at Amphipolis :

In the first of these he endured, with the greatest indifference, (—his training in gymnastics was so excellent—) hunger and thirst, heat and cold, and in one of the skirmishes that took place, Alcibiades falling wounded, he rescued and carried him off. While fighting at Delium he saved the life of his pupil, Xeno-

phon, whom he carried from the field on his shoulder fighting his way as he went. The only office he held was that of a senator. There he showed great firmness in voting against the iniquitous sentence by which the victors of Argunisæ were condemned to death.

Of course much need not be said on the subject of his trial on which many opinions have been entertained. But one thing is certain, that he solicited death of his own accord without proposing a higher sum of fine which Crito would gladly have paid. His life if not to the majority—for great men are not always for the mass or for the contemporaries—would at least have been beneficial to his immediate friends and dependants. Besides, there were Plato, Critobulus, and Apollodorus who had, along with Crito, asked him to propose a higher sum, and were willing to be his sureties. Anyhow his further remarks after he was found guilty was to the amazement of the judges and to the distress of his friends. Here, however, is a hostile remark on his trial :

“Socrates, though a thoroughly good and virtuous man, endowed with great self-control, a strong sense of duty, wonderful amiability of person, and indeed with almost all the qualities which obtain for an individual the love and admiration of his fellows, was deficient in a higher kind of political virtue ; that in fact, he was not a good citizen, because with every wish to obey the laws of the state, he could not refrain from broaching theories at variance with the first principles of a democratic constitution, because he could not prevail upon his intellectual convictions to bow before the supremacy of public opinion. That in the abstract, he might have been in the right, while all Athens was in the wrong, is not the question. As laws in a democratic state are made by the majority, the voice of one man or of a small class of men, though they may be all philosophers, will never justify the speakers in breaking through those rules, to which as members of the body politic, they are bound to submit.”

Anyhow, it is impossible to say whether his life would have been of any better help to the growth of philosophy in Greece, though one thing may be said that if he did not like a life of exile, he could at least have paid a fine and escaped death. Crito, who was willing to risk everything for him, would not have grudged him money to pay the fine with.

"In person Socrates was no less singular than he was in dress and manners. He had large projecting eyes, a sunken nose turned up at the end with wide dilated nostrils, and a great unwieldy belly; so that his appearance was not unlike that of Sileus and Satyrs, whom he also seemed to resemble in the severe mockery of his language. His dress was coarse and inelegant, and he seldom wore shoes....As he walked along the streets he strutted about in a most haughty supercilious manner, staring to the right and left at every one he met, sometimes stopping very suddenly in an absent fit and remaining for a considerable time fixed to the spot."

As a matter of fact, those that are extremely wise, and philosophers in particular, have queer habits, and whatever it is from a learned point of view, certainly there is a section of men that regard such as fools and madmen and enjoy a jest at the expense of such. Aristophanes, though a dramatist of great merits, was no exception and did not hesitate to make him a fit and proper subject for the caricature of comedy. Many a time appearances are deceiving, especially when men who are to judge others have not got that breadth of feeling and capacity to appreciate merits. Though outwardly Socrates seemed to be the embodiment of sensuality and even stupidity, yet inwardly he was as his friends knew "so pious that he did nothing without consulting the gods, so just that he never did any injury to any man, whilst he was the benefactor of his associates, so temperate that he never preferred pleasure to right, so wise that in judging of good and evil he was

never at fault, in a word he was the best and happiest of men." "His self-control was absolute; his powers of endurance were unfailing; he had so schooled himself to moderation that his scanty means satisfied all his wants." "To want nothing" he said to himself is divine; to want as little as possible is the nearest possible approach to the divine life."

SOCRATES' PHILOSOPHY.

"The philosophical merits of Socrates are less doubtful than his political character. The mere fact that he is made the chief interlocutor of those wonderful dialogues which contained the whole system of Plato, is sufficient to prove that he exerted no slight influence on the great philosopher, and though he never committed any of his own thoughts into writing, he has left indisputable traces of the important innovations of science of which he must be considered as the real author." There are three authorities with regard to this :

- (1) Xenophon's *Memorabilia* ;
- (2) Plato's *Dialogues* ; and
- (3) Aristotle's *Strictures*.

Of course Xenophon was a man of the world and had no independent interest in philosophy. He was only drawn to Socrates by the latter's wonderful way of holding conversations. "Xenophon having no philosophical views to develop, and no imagination to lead him astray,—being, in fact, to Socrates what Boswell was to Johnson—is an excellent witness. The *Memorabilia* are indeed confessedly apologetic, and it is easy to see that nothing is introduced which might embitter those who, hating Socrates, were ready to prosecute the Socratics; but the plain straight-forward narrative of Socrates' talk, on many occasions with many dissimilar interlocutors, carries with it in its simplicity and congruity the evidence of the substantial justice and truth." (*Chambers' Encyclopædia*). It can be said on

reliable authority that, even if he had tried, Xenophon could not have been able to give the philosophy of Socrates. . .

Plato gives a much truer conception of what he effected by his scientific labours. But Plato, "though he understood his master better, is a less trustworthy authority, and he makes Socrates the mouthpiece of his own more advanced and even antagonistic doctrines. Yet to all appearance the *Apology* is a careful and exact account of Socrates' habits and principles of actions; the earlier dialogues those which are commonly called "Socratic," represent with such changes only as are necessitated by their form, Socrates' method; and if in the later and more important dialogues the doctrine is the doctrine of Plato, echoes of the master's teaching are still discoverable approving themselves as such by their accord with the Xenophontian testimony. In the face of these two principal witnesses other evidence is of small importance" (*Chamber's Encyclopædia*).

Aristotle says that Socrates philosophised about virtue, and made some discoveries with regard to science.

Socrates is always found endeavouring to reduce everything to first principles, stripping realities of their pompous garb of words, and striving to arrive at certainty as the standard of truth. His philosophy is generally applied to ethics rather than physics. He considered it to be his vocation to arouse the idea of science in the minds of men. He believed that no one is bad willingly, but only from ignorance and confusion. The resolution effected by Socrates is well remarked by Cicero as consisting of bringing philosophy from heaven to earth. The immediate object of his teaching was the attainment of clear ideas and concepts, the highest of all being that of the good. Referring to his mother, who was a midwife, he is said to have observed that just as her calling in life was to deliver children into the world from the womb, even so was his calling to watch over

mental parturition and deliver ideas from the mind. The method he employed to effect this was irony or pretended ignorance, and appearing to seek knowledge he used to question the supposed learned man till at last he was hopelessly confused and would keep silent if not admit defeat. Anyhow he brought about a revolution in the thinking Greek mind, and it "consisted, (1) in the introspective method he employed, the change in the subject-matter of philosophy, from things to ideas, from being to knowing, and (2) in the ethnical and individual is the tendency of all his work."—BAX.

With regard to his proofs, a German authority says : "It is impossible to start from one true thought and to be entangled in a contradiction with any other, and also knowledge derived from any one point and obtained by correct combination cannot contradict that which has been deduced in like manner from any other point". It would have been interesting if Socrates had taken a step further to know what knowledge is. For by what other means could he have been enabled to declare that which others believed themselves to know, to be no knowledge than by a correct conception of knowledge?

Those were the days when Athens was full of sophists. They professed to know everything and what Socrates endeavoured was "to nullify the effects of their acquired knowledge by shifting the ground from the objects to the idea of science" whereby he generally succeeded in proving their deficiency in one thing needful to the philosopher. "His irony as it is called is another remarkable proof of his devotion to his vocation as an awakener of the idea of science. The irony of Socrates has been well described as co-existence of the idea of science in him, with the want of clear and complete views on any object of science—in a word, as the knowledge of ignorance." With this is indirectly connected the indirect logical method, which he invariably adopted, and which may be considered as his method of extracting

scientific truth from the mass of semblances and contradictions by which it was surrounded. His *daemonian* or secret monitor, which was a great puzzle to his contemporaries, as it has been to many of the moderns, seems to have been little more than a name which he gave to those convictions on practical subjects which sprung up spontaneously in his mind, and for which he could not find any satisfactory means of accounting, though he himself was constrained to follow in the course which they prescribed, as when he felt convinced of the issue of an undertaking, or was restrained by some secret misgiving from taking a certain route on his retreat from a disastrous battle."

Socrates so thoroughly original man, could gather around him all the original and thinking men. His business was to make them think for themselves. The Socratic impulse once communicated, it would take a different direction according to the character and natural bias. Though Socrates may be considered to be the basis of the whole superstructure, he can have no more claim to the whole merit of the Platonic philosophy than he is entitled to be blamed for the reckless inconsistencies of Alcibiades or the selfish policy of Xenophon. There is a Socratic element in all schools of Greek philosophy, for such was the effect of his method. One thing must be noted, and that is, he insisted upon the consciousness of ignorance and also he made use of the Delphic oracle to the effect, "Know Thyself"—or it would not have been difficult for him to leave some works containing an enunciation of his "dogmas."

There were some who were really interested in his philosophy, and they sought to derive some definite result from the life and teachings of their master. They sought to formulate for themselves and for their followers the teachings of their master, and thus three systems, called Socratic schools, came to existence.

(a) The *Megaric* school was originated by Euclid of Megara. He was first an Eleatic philosopher, but after

his contact with Socrates, began to interweave ingeniously the Socratic ethics with the One-Being doctrine of Parmenides. If the *good* was the subject matter of Socratic philosophy, his was, virtue, knowledge, God, etc., all as many names of this absolute fact.

(b) The *Cyrenaic* school was started by Aristippus of Cyrene. He despised all that had no immediate bearing on practice, and the life of man alone had interest for him. He maintains that all knowledge was in essence merely that of our own feeling. "All states of consciousness are reducible to violent motion, moderate motion, and lack of all motion. The first is pain, the second is pleasure, and the third is apathy." The practical side of philosophy was the attainment of pleasure, and the great art of life was avoiding pain and apathy. The Cyrenaic "wise man" would also seek the present happiness, and would not endure a present pain even with a view to a future pleasure. How different is this from the real teaching of Socrates especially as it is practically shown that as "noble is the prize, and great the hope," it is worth one's "while to stake everything on this belief." (See text book, pp. 206—7).

(c) The *Cynic* school was taught by Antisthenes. Its sole end was in the avoidance of pleasure and desires, for virtue was the one thing worth living for and deprivation and asceticism were necessary for it.

iii. PUBLIC TRIAL IN ATHENS.

The largest and the most important of the legal tribunals "*dicastery*" (*par excellence*) was known as the *heliaea*, the name denoting the place where the courts were held. During the days of Athenian democracy, the total number of persons who could vote are said to have been 6,000, and this number seems never to have been exceeded. Any Athenian, who was over 30, and in full possession of his rights, was entitled to be placed in the list. At the beginning of the year, the whole body of jurors took a solemn oath (1) that they would judge

according to the laws and decrees of the Athenian people and of the Council of Five Hundred (Boule); (2) that, in cases where there was no law, they would decide according to their best judgment; and (3) that they would hear both parties impartially and vote on the case actually before the court. The normal number of the jurors was 500,* the maximum number of 6,000 jurors being divided into ten sections of 500 each—the sections being distinguished by the first ten letters of the Greek alphabet—with 1,000 reserves. There is also evidence to show that in the fourth century, the numbers of jurors often were 200, 400, 500, 700, and in important political trials various multiples of 500, namely, 1,000, 1,500, 2,000, or 2,500. Every juror on his appointment received a ticket, and these tickets formed part of the machinery for allotting the jurors to the several courts. To guard against the possibility of bribery or other undue influence, the allotment did not take place until immediately before the hearing of the case. Each court contained an equal number of jurors from the ten tribes, and thus represented the whole body of the state. The juror on entering the court assigned to him received a counter on presenting of which at the end of the day, he received his fee. The large number of the jury made bribery difficult; though it does not seem to have been impossible. It also diminished the feeling of personal responsibility, while it increased the influence of political motives. In addressing such courts, the parties to the suits were not above appealing to personal interests of the general public. The speakers were also tempted to take advantage of the popular ignorance by misinterpreting the laws, and the jurors could not look for aid from the officials who formally presided over the law courts. The latter were not necessarily experts, and they owed their original appointment to the caprice of the lot.

* Notice, Socrates was found guilty by 280 votes against 220, the number of jurors being thus 500.

Legal actions were of two kinds, private and public, the latter being called prosecutions. Public actions were further divided into ordinary criminal cases and offences against the state. As a rule, they could be instituted by any person who possessed the franchise, and the penalty was paid to the state. If the prosecutor failed to obtain one-fifth of the votes, he had to pay a fine of 1,000 drachimæ* and also lost his right of ever bringing a similar action. There were three different modes of securing the person of the offender according to the nature of the case,—(1) the accused was summarily arrested by the prosecutor and conducted to the presence of the proper official; (2) the accuser took the officer with him, and had the culprit arrested; and (3) he lodged the "information" and the official had to effect the capture.

The ordinary procedure in a law-suit (public or private) began with the personal summoning of the defendant by the plaintiff accompanied by two witnesses. If the defendant failed to appear before the court, these witnesses gave proof of the summoning, and the judgment went by default. The action began by presenting a written statement of the case to the Magistrate who presided over the trials of the class in question. If the statement was accepted, the court-fee was paid by both the parties in a private action and by the prosecutor himself in a public action. The Magistrate then fixed a day for the preliminary investigation, and whenever several cases were instituted at the same time, he drew lots to determine the order in which they should be taken. The plaintiff and the defendant swore as to the truth of the statement, and if the defendant raised no formal protest the trial proceeded in regular course, but he might contend that the law-suit was inadmissible and to prove his point, might bring witnesses to confront those on the side of the plaintiff, or he might rely on argument without witnesses by means of a written

* See note at the bottom of the page 68, text book.

statement traversing that of the plaintiff. The preliminary action was to examine the documents, etc., and if any witness or other person was absent, to get a certified copy of the deposition.

The same Magistrate who used to preside over the preliminary investigation used to preside at the trial also. The proceedings began with a solemn sacrifice. The plea of the plaintiff and the formal reply of the defendant were then read by the clerk. The court was next addressed first by the plaintiff and then by the defendant. In some cases there were two speeches on each side. Every litigant was legally required to conduct his own case. The speeches were often composed by professional experts for delivery by the parties to the suit, who were required to speak in person, though one or more unprofessional supporters* might subsequently speak in support of the case. The length of the speeches was in many cases limited by law to a fixed time recorded by means of a water-clock. Documents were not regarded as parts of the speech, and while these were being read, the clock was stopped. Witnesses were never cross-examined, but one of the litigants might formally interrogate the other. The case for the defence was sometimes finally supported by pathetic appeals on the part of relatives and friends.

When the speeches were over, votes were taken. Each juror was given two disks,—each one one inch in diameter with a short tube running through the centre. The tube was either perforated or closed. There were two urns placed in the court, one of bronze and the other of wood. The juror placed in the hollow of his hand the disk he proposed to use, and closed his fingers on the extremity of the tube, so that no one could see whether it was a perforated disk or not, and then deposited it in the bronze urn, and observing the

* Notice, Plato went to speak on behalf of Socrates after his speech was over, but was not allowed.

same secrecy he dropped the other or the unused one into the wooden urn. The votes were then sorted by persons appointed for the purpose, and were then counted by the president of the court. If the votes were equal, then the defendant was discharged.

Pecuniary penalties were inflicted in a private or public suit, but personal penalties in a public suit only. Personal penalties were death or exile, or different degrees of disfranchisement with or without confiscation. Imprisonment before trials was common, and the persons mulcted in penalties might be imprisoned until the penalties were paid, but imprisonment was never inflicted, as the sole penalty for conviction. Foreigners alone could be sold into slavery. Sentences of death were carried out under the supervision of the board of police called the "Eleven." There were executions of various kinds in the beginning, but in later times the condemned had to drink the fatal hemlock.

The *Apology* may be divided into three parts, (1) before conviction ; (2) after conviction and before the sentence ; and (3) after the sentence. Before his conviction Socrates points out to the court how grossly he had been misrepresented by his enemies for several years past, cross-examines Meletus (an inferior poet), and then explains to the court that every one of the charges against him was a lie. He next dwells on the ridiculous way of appealing to the mercy of the jurors and says that for the credit of Athens no such thing should be done. After the conviction he points out that, but for the co-operation of Lycon (a rhetorician) and Anytos (a leather-dealer), Meletus could not have secured even one-fifth of the number of votes (that is, 100 votes), and so far he has escaped Meletus. In proposing a counter-penalty he finds that neither fine nor exile is suited to him, and remarks that he had done nothing to deserve punishment, and instead of being punished, he must be maintained at the Prytaneum. He is then sentenced to death. Instead

of feeling sorry he boldly says that " no evil can happen to a good man either in life or after death. Wherefore Socrates will not be angry with his condemners, who have done him no harm, although they meant him anything but good. He will only ask of them to do the sons of Socrates as he had done to them." Throughout the *Apology* Socrates appears as an intrepid reformer.

Crito gives an impression of the picture of him as a loyal and law-abiding Athenian. That Crito was the best friend of Socrates can be seen and appreciated there alone.

Phædo : Phædo a Greek philosopher and founder of the Eliac school so called from Elis, the place of his birth. He was descended from an illustrious family; but he had the misfortune in early life to be deprived of his patrimony and sold as slave at Athens. He attracted the notice of Socrates, who observed in his countenance the marks of an ingenious mind, and persuaded one of his friends to purchase his freedom. From that time Phædo applied to the study of moral philosophy under Socrates with the greatest assiduity, and to the last, retained the most affectionate attachment to his master. He established a school at Elis after the Socratic model in which though it is spoken of as a distinct school of philosophy he, and his successors adhered closely to the simple doctrines and useful precepts which they had received from Socrates. Plato as a mark of respect to this philosopher gave the name of *Phædo* to one of his " dialogues." The immortality of the soul is the chief point that is discussed here, and for other points see the beginning of the notes.

NOTES.

THE

TRIAL AND DEATH OF SOCRATES.

— — — — —

THE APOLOGY.

— — — — —

SUMMARY.—Socrates defends himself in the Court of Justice. There are two charges against him :—

(1). *Socrates offends against the laws in not paying respect to those gods whom the city respects, and introducing other new deities ;*

(2). *He also offends against the laws in corrupting the youth.*

(i). Socrates opens his apology by saying that everything that has been spoken against him is complete falsehood. He says that he is seventy years old and has to come for the first time before a Court of Law. He appeals to the Athenians that they need not mind the style of his speech, but give their whole attention to the question if what he says is just or not. He promises to speak the whole truth. (ii) He has two sets of enemies, those who are persistently misrepresenting him for a long time and have thus prejudiced the Athenians against him, and Meletus and others who are his accusers in the present case. He tries to remove the prejudice which the Athenians had against him for a long time, and though he knows the task a difficult one, yet he promises to obey the law and make his defence. (iii) The persistent falsehood against him

was some such thing: "Socrates is an evil-doer, who meddles with inquiries into things beneath the earth, and in heaven, and 'who 'makes the worse appear the better reason,' and who teaches others these same things." He refers to *The Clouds* where he is parodied. (iv) He says he has not got the knowledge of earning money by teaching others. (v) He requests the listeners not to interrupt him even though they think he is speaking arrogantly. He refers to the declaration of the Oracle that there was no wiser man than Socrates. (vi) He says that after he heard it he went out to examine every man who was reputed to be wise, and that was the cause of his unpopularity, for he tried to prove to him that he was not wise as he fancied. He thus made many enemies. (vii) That his enemies were increasing every day caused him much unhappiness and anxiety, and, nevertheless, he was prepared to test the declaration of the Oracle to the very last. He first tried politicians and then poets. (viii) He next went to the artizans and though they possessed a knowledge which he did not possess, yet they committed the same mistake as the poets and believed that they were extremely wise in matters of the greatest importance. Socrates thus finds that they all possess a knowledge, though the real nature of it they are ignorant of, and prefers to remain as he was without either their knowledge or ignorance. (ix) He explains that it is only God who is really wise, and if the Oracle declared so, it meant, 'He among you is the wisest, who, like Socrates, knows that in very truth his wisdom is worth nothing at all.' He considers his cross-examining of those who called themselves 'wise' was a service to God, and by reason of it he had no leisure to take part in public matters or to look after his private affairs. (x) He next says that the sons of wealthy persons who follow him imitate his method of cross-examination, and that makes the cross-examined get angry, not at their own ignorant selves, but at him, who, they consider, corrupts young men, though he has nothing to teach

them. (xi) Thus defending himself against persistent calumnies that were being propagated against himself he passes to the present charges against him. (xii) He cross-examines Meletus about the matter of improving young men, and tries to make it clear from what Meletus says that he (Meletus) takes no interest at all in the matters about which he is prosecuting him (Socrates). He holds that all cannot improve young men, though he hopes that one may have skill enough to do so. (xiii) The charge against him was that he corrupts the young intentionally, and he tries to point out that it is not the case. He adds, even supposing he does so unintentionally, there is no provision in the laws of Athens to prosecute him for that. (xiv) Meletus says that Socrates does not believe in the gods in any way whatever and is a complete atheist. Socrates says that Meletus is prosecuting him simply in the insolence and wantonness of youth and shows how inconsistent he is. (xv) Socrates makes Meletus admit that there is no man who believes in the existence of divine things and not in the existence of divinities, and adds that, as he believes in the divinities, it is wrong to suppose he does not believe in the gods. He adds that Meletus must have indicted him in that manner either to test his skill, or because he could not find any other crime that he could accuse him of with truth. (xvi) Prejudice and suspicion of the multitude, he says, have often been the cause of destruction of many good men before him, and adds that there is no fear that he shall be the last victim. (xvii) Socrates would not change his post for fear of death. To fear death may be to think ourselves wise while we are not so, and death, perhaps, can be the greatest good that can happen to man. No fear of death would make him give up his philosophy and from exhorting others and declaring the truths to every one. (xviii) He says that his defence is to try to persuade Athenians not to put him to death, for that would be to sin against God, as it means the rejecting of his gift to them, for it would not be easy to fill his place

after his death. He says God has sent him to attack the city even as He would do a gadfly to arouse a sluggish horse. It was not a mere human impulse that led him to neglect all his interests and busy himself unceasingly in the interests of Athens, by going to each man himself like a father or an elder brother, and trying to persuade him to care for virtue. (xix) Yet he never came forward in the assembly to take part in the public councils, and if he had come, he should long have perished. It was his belief that he who would really fight for justice must do so as a private man, not in public, if he means to preserve his life even for a short time. (xx) None could make him do wrong for fear of death. Once the Thirty commanded him to bring over Leon the Salaminian from Salamis, so that they might put him to death. He quietly went away home without caring for their order for he knew it was wrong. (xxi) Also whenever he had to take part in public affairs, he had never yielded a single point in a question of right and wrong to any man. He did not charge anything for his conversation, and was ever ready to talk to any man, rich or poor, so long as he was ready to answer him and listen to what he had to say. (xxii) People delighted in spending time in his company because it was a delight to them to hear persons who thought themselves wise cross-examined by him. And if he had already corrupted any young men, they who had by then grown older, would come forward to accuse him for that ; or if they were unwilling themselves they had their kinsmen, their fathers, their brothers, or other relatives. He points out to several men in the court itself, and says that Meletus ought to have called some of them as witnesses, and suggests that if he forgot to do so, he might as well do it then while he would stand aside. (xxiii) He refers to the custom of weeping before the judges praying to acquit one's own self, and also of bringing one's own wife and children or other friends to move the court with their tears. He says that though he has a wife and children, he would not do anything of the sort. for that would

discredit him, the Athenians, and Athens. (xxiv). The judge has sworn to be impartial and decide the questions according to law, and he should be convinced by reason and not appealed to in other ways, which are neither good, nor just, nor holy. He concludes his defence by saying that he believes in the gods, and to them and to the Athenians he trusts his case to be decided as is best for them and for him. (xxv) He is found guilty by 281 votes to 220. Then he says he is not surprised, for he knew he would be found guilty, and adds that certainly he did not think the majority against him would be so narrow. But for the coming of Anytus and Lycon also to accuse him and secure votes, so many votes would not have been possible, and in that respect he has escaped Meletus. (xxvi) Death is proposed as the penalty, and if he were allowed to propose a counter-penalty, he would propose a public maintenance in the Prytaneum, for that is what he thinks he deserves for the life of selflessness he led. (xxvii) He says he must not be considered stubborn or arrogant in what he says next. If there were such a law in Athens, as elsewhere it was, not to finish a trial of life and death in a single day, he thinks he would have convinced them of the matter, but the time was short and it was not an easy matter. He could not choose any other punishment. Imprisonment is not suited as it would mean the slavery of successive officials. Fine would not suit him either, for he had no money to pay it with. Nor could he prefer exile, for at that stage of his life it was difficult for him to wander from city to city. Wherever he would go, young men would listen to him, and if he would drive them away, they would persuade their elders to expel him; and if he would not drive them away, their fathers and kinsmen would expel him for their sakes (xxviii) To withdraw from Athens and hold his peace was not possible either, and it was the most difficult thing in the world to make them understand why he could not do that. If he had been rich he would have proposed a very large fine, and as he was poor he could perhaps pay

a mina. But his friends persuade him to propose thirty and they would be sureties. (xxix) His proposal is not accepted and he is condemned to death. He is very old and would have died naturally very soon, and much is not gained by condemning him to death. If he was defeated it was not because that he was wanting in arguments but in overboldness and effrontery. To appeal weeping and wailing was unworthy of him (xxx) He prophesies that there would be more men who would call them to account, and they would be harder masters to them than he was. He asks them to make themselves more perfect rather than silencing reproaches. (xxxi) He was wont to receive a divine voice, and that would constantly oppose him if he was not going to act rightly. (xxxii) If death were absence of all sensations, there could be no better gain, and if it were a journey to another place where all who have died are found, there could be no good greater than that. (xxxiii) No evil can happen to a good man either in life or after death. Yet it was not with the mind that they condemned, and so far he could find fault with them. He adds they must vex his sons when they are grown up if they care for anything but virtue, and concludes by saying whether life or death is better, is known to God and God only.

Apology.—A speech made in defence. From Gr. *apologia*, *apo* off, *logos* a speech. "An *apology*, in the original sense of the word, was a *placating off* from some charge or imputation, by explaining and defending one's principles or conduct. It, therefore, amounted to a vindication. One who now offers an *apology* admits himself to have been, at least apparently, in the wrong, but brings forward some palliating circumstance, or tenders a frank acknowledgment, by way of reparation. We make an *apology* for some breach of propriety or decorum (like rude expressions, unbecoming conduct, &c.), or some deficiency in what might be reasonably expected. We offer an *excuse* when we have been guilty of some breach or neglect of duty ; and we do it by way

of extenuating our fault and with a view to be forgiven. When an *excuse* has been accepted, an *apology* may still in some cases be necessary or appropriate. "An *excuse* is not grounded on the claim of innocence, but is rather an appeal for favour of resting on some collateral circumstance. An *apology* mostly respects the conduct of individuals towards each other as equals ; it is a voluntary act produced by feelings of decorum, or a desire for the good opinion of others—CRABB."—WEBSTER.

N. B.—This apology was preserved by Plato who was a friend and disciple of Socrates. Plato, however, was in the court at the time of the trial (See page 72, last part of xxix), and it is likely that he must have preserved the very words of his master in spite of his overdoing him generally.

I. SOCRATES' REQUEST TO THE ATHENIANS TO GIVE HIM A PATIENT HEARING.

✓ *Impression*.—Effect or influence made on the senses, mind, feelings, or sentiment. The prefix *im-(in)* on, *primere* to press. The history of the word is interesting. " *Press* is a corruption of the old word *prest*, ready ; whence *prest-money*, ready money advanced to a man hired for service, earnest money ; also *imprest*, a verb (now *impress*), to give a man earnest money. When it became common to use *compulsion* to *force* men into service, it was confused with the verb *to press*."—SKEAT.

Accusers.—Those who would bring a charge against. *L. Ac (ad) to, causa, caussa*, a suit at law.

His accusers were three : Anytus, Lycon, and Meletus, " Anytus, acting against him on behalf of the magistrates, and because of his political principles ; Lycon, on behalf of the orators ; and Meletus on behalf of the poets, all of whom Socrates used to pull to pieces." The sworn informations, on which the trial proceeded, were drawn up in this fashion : " Meletus, the son of Meletus, of Pitthis, impeaches Socrates, the son of Sophroniscus of Alopece : Socrates is guilty inasmuch as he does not

believe in the gods whom the city worships, but introduces other strange deities ; he is also guilty inasmuch as he corrupts the young men and the punishment he has incurred is death."

For my own part.—To speak for my sake ; so far as I am concerned.

Plausible.—Worthy of being praised. The root is the same as in *applause*, from L. *plaudite* clap of one's hands.

Astonished.—Struck with wonder. M. E. *astonien*, *astunien*, *astonen* ; whence the later *astony*, afterwards lengthened into *astonish*. The addition of *-ish* as in *extinguish* is due to analogy with other verbs in *-ish*. *Astound* is the same form, and only there is an addition of excrescent *d* after *n* as in *sound*, from F. *son*. All these are derived from O. F. *estoner* (modern French, *étonner*), to amaze.

***Clever speaker.**—One who speaks with skill and adroitness.

N. B.—Socrates maintains from the beginning to the end that his accusers had not spoken one word of truth and that they prosecute him out of malice. The speech for the prosecution must naturally have been characterized with spite, and in the midst of it the Athenian jury who had been present in the law court must have been asked to be careful so that Socrates, who spent his life in conversation and who must naturally have been a "clever speaker," might not mislead them when he would make his apology.

The following extract may be read with advantage :—

"Some say that the Graces in the Acropolis are his (Socrates') work ; and they are clothed in figures. And that it is in reference to this that Timon says, in his *Silli* :—

From them proceeded the stone-polisher,
The reasoning legislator, the enchanter
Of all the Greeks, making them subtle arguers,
A cunning pedant, a shrewd Attic quibbler.

For he was very clever in all rhetorical exercises, also. Idomeneus also assures us. But the thirty tyrants forbade him to give lessons in the art of speaking and arguing, as Xenophon tells us. And Aristophanes turns him into ridicule in his comedies, as making the worse appear the better reason. For he was the first man, as Pharorinus says in his Universal History, who, in conjunction with his disciple Æschines, taught men how to become orators. And Idomeneus makes the same assertion in his essay on Socratic schools. He, likewise, was the first person who conversed about human life, and was also the first philosopher who was condemned to death and executed."—YONGE.

N. B.—Perhaps this has been suggested from the fact that Socrates was a good cross-examiner and would convince all reasonable people of their ignorance or fancied knowledge. The hint is to the effect that in spite of their conviction that he is guilty, he may so manage as to prove that he is not guilty, and they must be careful to take his words at their worth, and not to be misled by his beguiling words.

Careful not...you—Cautious so that they may not allow themselves to be beguiled by his words. *To mislead* is to lead or guide another into error.

Impudent—Shameless; wanting modesty. From *L. im-* (for *in*) not, *pudens* modest, present participle of *pudere* to feel shame. It thus means not feel ashamed in intentionally treating others without due respect.

Thus 'not to be ashamed' is redundant in this sentence.

In that way—In that manner; that is, to suggest that Socrates was a clever speaker and he would mislead the Athenians assembled in the law courts to vote in his case.

✕ Open my mouth—Begin to speak. *Mouth* in such cases is figuratively used to signify speech, language, or testimony. Cf.

"When I ope my *mouth* let no dogs bark."—SHAKES.

"That in the *mouth* of two or three witnesses every word may be established."

N. B.—*Mouth* often means a principal speaker, or one who utters a common opinion. In plural, it means to make a wry face or grimace : Cf.

"Every coffee-house has some particular statesman belonging to it, who is the *mouth* of the street where he lives."—ADDISON.

"Counterfeit sad looks,
Make *mouths* upon me when I turn my back."—SHAKES.

Lie—Falsehood : It is of two kinds, namely, falsehood of calling him a 'clever speaker' and also the falsehood of bringing supposed charges on him.

Exposed—Laid bare. Fr. *exposer*, *ex-out*, and *poser* to set, to place. Compare also *depose*, *compose*, etc. The idea is their lie will be laid bare before you so that you may judge for yourself what a folly it is on their part to accuse and misrepresent me thus.

Prove—Establish with facts and arguments.

In any way at all—In no manner whatever. The idea is, I am not only incapable of misleading you, but I have never been so.

Unless—If if not be that. Formerly it was *on les*, *on lesse*, *on lesse that*, and that is, in less than, on a less supposition than. The *un*-here stands for *on*.

They mean—Intend to convey the idea of.

N. B.—Notice the irony contained in what follows. If they mean that I am one who speaks the truth—a fact which I cannot gainsay—then I cannot defend myself against such an 'imputation.' And also they give you a hint that as I will speak out the truth and expose them, you must not heed my true remarks but vote against me indeed.

That—My being a truth-speaker.

I agree with him—I am one with them in holding. *agree* : Fr. *agreer*, to accept or to receive kindly, from

a, L. *ad*, *grē* good will, consent, liking, from L. *gratus* pleasing, agreeable. *Grateful* has the same root.

Orator—One skilled in the art of speech ; an eloquent speaker. From L. *orare* to speak. Cf,

"I am no *orator* as Brutus is."—SHAKES.

"Some *orator* renowned
In Athens or free Rome."—MILTON.

Than: This was originally the same word as *then* and equivalent to *then when*. Thus, for instance, the sentence, 'I am a much greater orator than they' would be 'I am a much greater then when they (are great orators)', that is, if it is admitted that they are great orators, then I am greater.

My accusers—Those who have brought an accusation or charge against me. From L. *accuso* to call to account, blame, indict ; *ad* to, *causo* cause, process.

Repeat—Say again, From L. *Re* again, *peto* to seek.

Said—Spoken ; that is, said when they made a speech for the prosecution.

Whole—Unimpaired ; unadulterated. The word is connected with *heal*.

Elaborate—One got ready with great labour. L. *e* out, greatly, *laborare* to work. *elaborare*

Drest up—Clothed pompously or gorgeously ; embellished. The idea is his speech will not be so magnificent as theirs and couched in such fine words and phrases.

"But the philosopher, after Lysias had prepared a defence for him, read it through, and said—'It is a, very fine speech, Lysias, but is not suitable for me ; for it was manifestly the speech of a lawyer rather than of a philosopher.' And when Lysias replied, 'How is it possible, that if it is a good speech it should not be suitable to you?' he said, 'Just as fine clothes and handsome shoes, would not be suitable to me.'"—YONGE.

The above extract shows that he was averse to make a legal speech, and was content to speak the truth, and truth alone, no matter what the result would be.

Without preparation—Without having thought of or arranged previously; extempore. From L. *præ* before, *parō* to get ready.

Come first—Occur of their own accord for the first time. The idea is the words and phrases I employ are what occur to me for the first time and not previously thought of and their effect weighed.

Believe—Am confident.

[PAGE 36.]

Cause—Case. This is also from L., *cause* a case, the same root as is found in *accuse*.

Just—Right. L. *iustus* right, that which is fitting. Hence it means upright or honest.

Anything else—Anything other than what is just or honest. *Else* is generally an adjective or pronoun, as the following examples will show:

Who *else* is coming? (Adj.)

What *else* shall I give you? (Adj.)

Do you expect anything *else*? (Adj.)

Bastards and *else*. (Adj.)—*K. John*.

Else always follows the noun or pronoun it qualifies, and it is usual to give the possessive form to *else* rather than to the substantive which precedes it; e. g., somebody else's room. It is also an adverb and means in the contrary case. Sometimes after 'or' it is used expletively as simply noting an alternative.

My friends: Notice the form of the address here and in what follows. He changes it into *judges* in xxxi, below.

Hardly—Scarcely.

Seemly—Fit; suitable; becoming. The root here is not the same as in *seem*. *Seem* is connected with *me* and is from A. S. *seman* to satisfy, conciliate, and

hence, to suit, a sense due to the adjective *scemly*, which is from *scmr* fit, with suffix—*liqr* like (-ly).

At my age : He was past seventy at the time of his trial, 399 B. C. Accounts vary with regard to the date of his birth, and anyhow it can be said on good authority that it was not earlier than 471 B. C. or later than June of 469. In the first case his age would be 72, and in the other 70. "I am more than seventy years old."—See below.

Come before—Appear in your presence.

Specious.—Superficially fair, just, or correct ; appearing well at first view. From L. *speciosus* showy, beautiful, from *species* show, appearance. Compare the extract cited from YONGE above. Compare also xxix, *post*, wherein he says that he is "an old man, far advanced in years, and near to death." And subsequently he adds that one should not be afraid of death, and the way in which he disobeyed the Thirty in not bringing Leon over from Salamis (See xx below) might show how he would not do wrong from the fear of death. It is not a wonder that a philosopher who was so very indifferent to worldly concerns and life must have rejected the defence which was written for him by Lysias.

* Specious falsehoods means a set of lies so got up and arranged together as to look very fair and all just.

Athenians : Notice the form of address. It is either my 'friends' or 'Athenians' till it changes to 'judges' in xxxi.

Earnestly—With an ardent zeal ; seriously A. S. *earnest* earnestness ; *earneste* (adj.) earnest, serious.

Beg, entreat : " *To beg*, in its original sense, was to ask with earnestness. and implied submission, or at least deference. At present, however, in polite life, *beg* has dropped its original meaning and has taken the place of both *ask* and *request*, on the ground of its expressing more of deference and respect. Thus we *beg* a person's

acceptance of a present ; we *beg* him to favour us with his company ; a tradesman *begs* to announce the arrival of new goods, etc. CRABB remarks that according to present usage, 'we can never talk of *asking* a person's acceptance of a thing, or of *asking* him to do us a favour.' This can be more truly said of usage in England than in America" (WEBSTER). To *entreat* is to ask earnestly, to petition, or pray. Cf.

"*Entreat* my wife to come —SHAKES.

"I do *entreat* your patience" — *Ib.*

"I must *entreat* you some of that money." — *Ib.*

Both the words are employed here by way of an appeal to the Athenians.

Surprised—Astonished. From Fr. *surprise*, which is from *surpris*, pp. of *surprendre*, to surprise. Prefix *sur-* (L. *super*) over, and *prendre*, L. *prendere*, to seize.

Interrupt—Stop in the middle. The word is modified through French. L. *inter* amongst, *rumpere* to break.

Defence—Apology. Literally the word means striking down or away. L. *de* down, *fendere* to strike. Cf. *offence*. The Sanskrit form of the root is *han*.

Accustomed—Habituated. L. *Ad* to, and A. F. *habitude* custom.

Market-place—An open square or place in a town where markets or public sales are held.

Where...elsewhere: that is, 'where and elsewhere many of you have heard me.'

I have ever come—I have ever appeared.

Your manner of speech—The way in which you speak here. Notice the contrast. Socrates intends to say that he is going to speak before the Court of Law in exactly the same way as he is used to do outside of it, in a way peculiar to him. He would not attempt a legal speech but simply give them facts for their own judgment. *Your* is used impersonally here. Cf.

"There are more things in heaven and earth, Horatio, than are dreamt of in *your* philosophy."—*Hamlet*.

Your manner of speech here means the manner of speech here with which you are acquainted.

Strange—Unfamiliar. The word is modified though French, the form in old French being *estrange*, from Latin *extraneus*, foreign, on the outside.

Observe, he wants to impress on their mind the language he employs is not the one that is to be expected in a Court of Law, and as an excuse he adds that those forms of addressing a Court are quite unfamiliar to him. He goes on to say that if he were an actual stranger in Athens, probably he would have been excused the drawback, but now as he is an Athenian, and is expected to know the way in which a speech is to be made in a Court of Law, any breach of rule, that way would make presumption against him all the more strong, he implores that he may be excused the manner of his speech.

Style—Mode of expressing thought in language, oral or written. Cf.

"Proper words in proper places make the true definition of *style*."—SWIFT.

He next takes both the possible aspects, and says 'it may be better or it may be worse', that is to say, it may be better than the manner of speech adopted in a Court of Law or it may be worse than that. It comes to mean that they need not appreciate his style if that is better than the one generally employed in a defence speech, though they should excuse him in case it is worse.

Whole attention—Complete attention.

Question—Judicial investigation ; the decisive investigation of the matter which is now doubtful ; inquiry. From L. *querere* to seek, *-tion* being the suffix.

Makes : Notice this use. Cf.,

Writing *makes* an exact man.'

Advocate—One who pleads a cause in a court of law; one who is called upon to plead. L. *ad* to, *vocare* to call.

Socrates' idea is that one has best advocated a cause when he has spoken the truth, that is, when he has represented his case truly and without any additions or embellishments of his own, and they are good judges who would not care for the style or the manner in which a case was represented, but only confine their attention to a single fact whether what was represented is true or not.

II. HIS TWO SETS OF ENEMIES.

Old false charges.—False accusations brought against Socrates not before a Court of Law but before the public for a long time. The idea is that he was being continuously misrepresented to the public, and it was so very persistent that the minds of many was charged with prejudice so much so that it was not easy to remove it with any arguments to the contrary.

Old accusers—Men who in time past persistently calumniated him in more ways than one.

Later ones—The two charges that were brought against him lately and which have necessitated the present trial. See the beginning of the summary for the wording of the charges.

Present accusers—Meletus Anytus, and Lycon. See x, below.

Accusing me to you—Misrepresenting me to you.

Who have...truth: The whole sentence of which this is a clause is very rugged. It means this: 'For many men have been accusing me to you for very many years; and they have not uttered a word of truth.'

Them—Those men who are persistently accusing for very many years.

I fear them—I am afraid of them, because they have created a prejudice in the minds of many ever since they were children, and, as that prejudice is deep-rooted, it is very difficult to eradicate it. My apology is enough to convince anybody that the present charges against me are false, but as I am afraid your minds are prejudiced ever since you were children, I am not sure if you would base your judgment on actual facts and vote in favour of me.

Companions—His associates in bringing charges against me.

Formidable—Capable of exciting fear or apprehension; impressing dread. *L. formidabiles*, from *formidare* to fear, dread.

As expresses concession here and approaches *though* in meaning. Thus 'formidable as they are' means '(admitting) as (I do that) they are formidable', that is, 'though they are formidable.'

A. R.—Though of course it is recorded in the Apology that his three accusers acted on behalf of poets, artizans and politicians, and orators respectively, yet another account is this: In consequence of his wise sayings and actions, "the priestess at Delphi was witness in his favour, when she gave Charephon this answer, which is so universally known :

Socrates of all the mortals is the wisest.

In consequence of which answer, he incurred great envy; and he brought envy also on himself, by convicting men who gave themselves airs of folly and ignorance, as undoubtedly he did to Anytus; and as is shown in Plato's *Meno*. For he, not being able to bear Socrates' jesting, first of all set Aristophanes to attack him, and then persuaded Meletus to institute a prosecution against him, on the ground of impiety and of corrupting the youth of the city. Accordingly Meletus instituted the prosecution; and Polyeuctus pronounced the sentence, as Pharorinus records in his *Universal History*;

Polycrates, the sophist, wrote the speech, which was delivered, as Hermippus says, not Anytus as others say and Lycon, the demagogue, prepared everything necessary to support the impeachment. (See note at the bottom of the page 68, text book).—YONGE.

Plato's account is, however, endorsed by Antisthenes in his "Successions of the Philosophers."

[PAGE 37.]

Those others : *Those* here is a demonstrative adjective.

Got hold of—Obtained hold of, that is to say, obtained masterful influence over.

When you were children—When you were very young, and naturally so credulous that you had not the power to distinguish between a right report and a false one.

Persistent—Continuing steadily and firmly ; continuing in the face of some amount of opposition. *L. per* through, *sisto* to stand.

In accusing me with lies—In spreading false reports against me.

Persuade you—Influence you by argument ; convince you by arguing and offering you some supposed reasons. *L. per* effectively, *suadco* to advise, urge.

One Socrates : *Socrates* is here a noun in apposition to *one*, which is the complement of the verb of incomplete predication *is*.

A wise man—A man having the powers of discerning and judging correctly.

Notice the irony contained here and in what follows:—

In consequence of the answer of the Oracle to Chærephon, he incurred great envy. It thus made many speak calumniously of him and make sarcastic references to his wisdom and mode of discourse.

Speculates about the heavens—Takes gods as the subject matter of his proposition and examines it in its various aspects and relations; starts various theories about gods. *L. speculatus*, from *specula* a look-out, from *specio* to see. *Heavens* here means gods. As the container is used for the thing contained, the figure is *synecdoche*. But the figurative use of this word has become so commonplace that the sense of the figure itself has been forgotten.

N. B.—It is said that it was Criton who made him leave his workshop and instruct men, out of the admiration which he conceived for his abilities. Those were the days when Athens was the centre of culture and civilization, and wherever one would turn he would find "the same eager pursuit of knowledge, and the same eager effort to apply it directly to practice. The method of earth-measurement was rapidly becoming a science; the astronomy of Meton was introducing precision into the computation of time; Hippodamus was revolutionising architecture by building towns and straight broad streets; and old-fashioned soldiers were grumbling at the new pedantries of "tactics" and "hoplitics." Again the art of music had recently received a great technical development; and still greater change had been effected in that training of the body which along with music, constituted ordinary Greek education".....(SIDGWICK). Socrates seems to have perceived that natural philosophy had no immediate bearing on our interests* however much they may interest philosophers and scientists, and began to enter on moral speculations and on speculations about gods. "Indeed, throughout the age of Socrates", says Professor SIDGWICK, "sophists and philosophers were commonly regarded, by those who refused to recognize their higher claims, as teaching an "art of words." It is to this that there is a reference here,

* It is said that when he once saw Euclid exceedingly anxious about some dialectic arguments, he said to him, "O Euclid, you will acquire a power of managing sophists, but not of governing men."

and Socrates being the first philosopher of the sort, it is likely that he was ridiculed all the more.

Examines into...earth—Carefully looks into the condition of all those things situated beneath the earth.

The Greek notion was that there is one region above the earth and the other below, the former being heaven and the latter hell. The idea, therefore, is that Socrates does not believe in heaven and hell as everybody does but tries to examine into their nature, condition, etc. Thus the first charge against him.

Make reason : Here there is a sarcastic reference to his manner of discourse and argument. It is intended to signify that he overpowers others with his arguments, with the result that they have to yield their ground, no matter however true their ideas are.

Spread abroad—Propagate without any restriction or limit.

Their hearers think—Those who listen to them begin to imagine.

Pursue such inquiries—Employ themselves with such investigations.

Believe in the gods—Have faith in divinity. The idea is an inquiry into the state of heaven and hell may, without any harm, be conducted, and still it is consistent with one's belief in the gods. At present his calumniators create an impression upon the minds of the public that because he pursues such an investigation for the sake of a better or truer knowledge, he has no belief in the gods.

Attacks—Calumnies. *Attach* and *attack* are from the same root, and are doublets.

Going on—Continuing.

Most readily to believe them—When you would with neither hesitation nor inquiry place implicit belief in them; readily credulous.

You were all young . . . children—You were at such a tender age when one lacks power of discrimination.

To answer them—To speak in return to what they said; to reply to them; to refute their arguments. *Answer* is from A. S. *andswaru*, and against, in reply, *swerian* to speak, to swear. Thus it is equivalent to *anti-swear*. The two reasons assigned for the popular prejudice against him are :

(1) His enemies misrepresented him to the credulous public ; and

(2) There was no one to refute them and defend him.

The most unreasonable thing : He means to say that it is most unreasonable that those that are not known to him even by name should go and speak ill of him in that manner.

Commonly—In general.

× **Comic poets :** Those who compose comedies. *Comedy* was a festive spectacle with singing, etc. It is equivalent to *comos* a banquet, revel, festal occasion, and *ode* a song. It is also suggested that it is equivalent to *come* a village, and *ode* a song, for comedy was originally of a lyric character. "The Greeks had certain festal processions of great licentiousness, held in honour of Dionysos, in the suburbs of their cities, and termed *komoï* or village-revels. On these occasions an ode was generally sung, and this ode was the foundation of Greek comedy".—(BREWER.) A comedy is thus a "dramatic composition, or representation of a bright and amusing character, based upon the foibles of individuals, the manners of society, or the ludicrous events or accidents of life." (WEBSTER). Thus mirth should predominate in a comedy, and thus sarcasm, etc., find a fit place in it. Socrates and his queer manners, therefore, were regarded as best suited for the purpose. For example, ARISTOPHANES speaks thus of him (praising him in the very matter for which he ridicules him) :

" Prudent man, who thus with justice long for mighty wisdom,
 Happiness will be your lot in Athens, and all Greece too ;
 For you've a noble memory, and plenty of invention,
 And patience dwells within your mind, and you are never tired,
 Whether you're standing still, or walking ; and you care not
 for cold,
 Nor do you long for breakfast time, nor e'er give in to hunger ;
 But wine and gluttony you shun, and all such kind of follies " ,
 Also he has,

" You strut along the streets, and look around you proudly,
 And barefoot many ills endure, and hold your head above us."

AMEIPSIAS introduces him on the stage in a cloak,
 and speaks thus of him :

" O Socrates. among few men the best,
 And among many vainest ; here at last
 You come to us courageously—but where,
 Where did you get that cloak ? so strange a garment,
 Some leather-cutter must have given you
 By way of joke : and yet this worthy man,
 Though ne'er so hungry, never flatters any one."

These are some of the misrepresentations which Socrates had known and can therefore refer to them. See also introduction to the text-book, pp. xix, and xxxiii and xxxiv. The account given by Aristophanes is a misrepresentation pure and simple, and that even he could be convinced by Socrates is plain from the fact narrated in the introduction to the text-book, p. xxxv.

All the rest—All who are other than the comic poets. *Rest* is here a noun. L. *re, stare* to stand ; *i.e.*, those who would remain behind after some have been taken away. The phrase is equivalent to 'all of the rest,' that is, every one that remains.

Prejudice—Bias or leaning towards one thing for reasons other than justice ; A preconceived, generally unfavourable, notion. L *pre* before, *judicium* judgment, that is to form a judgment previous to a trial or hearing and examining of facts.

Motives—Objects. L *motivus* moving, because a motive impels one to do a thing.

→ **Spite** is a contracted form of *despite*, the first syllable being omitted. It means ill-will or hatred towards another "accompanied with the disposition to irritate, annoy, or thwart." "*Spite* is a temper which delights to express itself in bitter and cutting language, or in low and irritating actions. It is, therefore, meaner than *malice*, though not always more criminal." (WEBSTER). The idea of thwarting can clearly be seen in the phrase *in spite of*. L. *despectus* a looking down upon, a despising.

→ **Jealousy** is a disposition to respect rivalry in matters of interest and affection. It is "a painful apprehension of rivalry in cases that are peculiarly interesting to us." COGAN. It is, therefore, stronger than *suspicion*. The word is another form of *zealous*, L. *zelus*, Gr. *zelos* zeal.

Conviction—The quality of being convinced. *Conviction* is a settled belief founded on satisfactory proofs which appeal to reason and it is to be distinguished from persuasion, which is an assent founded on what appeals to the feelings and imagination.

He takes a very fair consideration of his enemies and assigns two reasons for their persistent effort to prejudice the public against him :

- (1) They do it out of spite and jealousy ; and
- (2) In some cases it may be out of conviction.

Call forward—Necessitate them to come forward before the court.

Cross-examine—To examine a witness to a suit by the opposite party.

Cross-examination, therefore, in law means the interrogating or questioning of a witness by the party against whom he has been called and examined, and is to be distinguished from an *examination-in-chief* which is conducted by the party calling him. The purpose of *examination-in-chief* is to prove a case, while that of *cross-examination* is to create a doubt with regard to

the testimony of a witness, or elicit such information from him which may ultimately disprove a case.

N. B.—It may also mean here that Socrates wanted to cross-examine them in his usual way with regard to their knowledge of particular facts—*e. g.*, his examining of Enthyphron with regard to piety—and make it plain that they were spreading false reports against him because they were ignorant of what he really was.

Shadows—Not with actual persons.

[PAGE 38.]

To put questions...answer: This is said with regard to his idea of proving things by cross-examination. He means to say that if his translators were there in the court, he would make them admit that they were wrong.

Older ones—Those persons who have misrepresented him for many a past year.

With your leave—By your permission. A polite way of introducing what follows.

His purpose in defending himself against his old enemies is to try to remove the prejudice which has been created in the minds of the Athenians, who are now his jurors, before he can prove the falsity of the charges against him, for, so long as the prejudice lasts, any effort in the other direction cannot be of any practical use.

In the short time allowed me: The law of Athens seems to have been to finish the case in a single day, no matter how important it might have been, and in this respect it differed from the law of other states. See p. 70, text-book.

Manage—Conduct the affairs in a suitable way to accomplish the desired object, *Manage* was originally a substantive meaning government of a horse control administration, but now it is superseded by *management*. Ital, *Mano* the hand, L. *manus* the hand. *Manage*, which is a verb, is derived from this,

If it be good...me—If it is for our mutual advantage, you to be removed of your prejudice and I to expect fair justice at your hands.

That my defence...successful—He hopes to be successful because—

(1) He tries to remove their prejudice, and

(2) He speaks the whole truth and proves the folly of his accusers.

That...successful—is a substantive clause governed by the transitive verb *hope*.

Quite aware—Perfectly conscious. Prefix *a*, and *ware*, A. S. *gewær* wary, cautious.

Be : Imperative.

Issue—Result. O. F. *issue* the issue, end, event, *exire* to go out, *ex* out, *ire* to go.

As God wills :—This expression is in itself sufficient to show that Socrates did believe in the gods.

I must obey the law—I must submit myself to the law of Athens.

III. A REFERENCE TO ARISTOPHANE'S PLAY.

N. B.—It is to be noticed that the words 'charge' and 'accusation' are used commonly with regard to the old and new enemies. Socrates thinks that the one is as good an accusation as the other, though, perhaps, misrepresentation is a better word.

Given rise to—Has caused the origin of; brought into existence.

Which was.....indictment : This shows that Meletus must have realized the fact that popular prejudice against Socrates was very strong, and in case that he would indict him he would secure the required number of votes. (See note on p. 68, text-book).

Relied on—Rested with confidence fully satisfied of the possibility: depended upon. *Rely* : Prefix *re*, and *lie*.

Drew—Wrote.

Indictment—Charge [The formal statement of an offence, as found by the prosecuting authority of the State, and found by the grand jury].

Note.—It is the peculiar province of a grand jury to *indict*, as it is of a house of representatives to *impeach*. To the validity of an indictment a finding by the grand jury is essential, while an information rests only on presentation by the prosecuting authority.

M. F. *indicter*, O. F. *inditer* to indict, accuse. *Indite* is the French form of spelling.

Calumny—False and baseless evil reports. F. *calomnie*, L. *calumniā* false accusation.

Assume—Take for granted ; suppose as a fact. L. *ad* to, *seems* to take. The same root is seen also in *consume*, *presume*, etc.

Formally—In due manner of law.

Run—Purport.

Somewhat : Notice this is an adverb.

Fashion—Manner. The word is derived from L. *fac* to make, though French. *Fashion* and *fiction* are doublets.

The idea is, supposing that my old enemies are charging me with an offence, and write out that charge. Then it would be to the following effect.

Evil doer—One who brings on mischief ; one whose actions cause much mischief or injury to the society or to their good manner of living. *Ill* is a contracted form of *evil*.

Meddles with—Tampers ; readily and impertinently takes part in such to produce evil or pernicious effects.

Makes the worse.....reason : Socrates' method of cross-examining began to show conspicuously that there were deficiencies in the professions of sophists, and what as thought knowledge by some was worse than igno-

ance. In spite of the efforts of the great questioner to convince them of the real nature of their knowledge, many refused to admit that their knowledge was defective, and, on the other hand, tried to accuse Socrates himself that he was a clever speaker and 'makes the worse appear the better reason.'

These same things: These very worse things he makes appear the better reason.

It must be noted that this supposed charge contains the very facts contained in the two charges against him and what Socrates wants to impress upon the minds of the listeners is, that the accusation is not a new one, but one that was going on for a number of years past.

The comedy of Aristophanes—*The Clouds*. *Aristophanes*. (B. C. 444—380). A Greek who wrote fifty-four Comedies, eleven of which, it is said, have survived to the present day is called the "Prince of Ancient Comedy." In 423 he produced the *Clouds*, which along with the *Knights* are the two most famous of his comedies. They exhibit in overflowing richness that fancy, wit, humour, satire, and shrewd insight which characterize this greatest of all Greek comic writers. The *Clouds*, however, displays, at the same time, the weaknesses and limitations of Aristophanes' mind. Its aim was to deride the pretensions of the new sophistical school, and to point out its pernicious tendencies. So far well. But Aristophanes was no philosopher, and demonstrates his own incapacity to appreciate the highest range of thought and character, by selecting no less a person than Socrates as the most perfect representative of a sophist. Aristophanes, who was both religiously and politically a conservative, had apparently no clear conception of abstract truth than is involved in reverence for the sanctities of the past, the old gods, old traditions, old manners, and old sentiments. He had an instinctive hatred of innovations, and considered all equally pernicious. As he had represented Cleon the reformer as a vulgar innovator and

demagogue, ruled by the lowest considerations, he makes the innovating views of Socrates also proceed from corrupt motives, veiled perhaps with more craft. Alcibiades is caricatured in this brilliant comedy as a wildly extravagant youth whose career of ruin is accelerated by the insidious instructions of Socrates, and a hint is thrown out towards the end of the piece, which unfortunately proved to be the 'shadow' of a 'coming event.' Aristophanes represents the father of Alcibiades as about to burn the philosopher and his whole *phrontisterion* (subtlety-shop); and there can be little doubt that this dramatic vilification of the purest of heathen moralists led to that persecution, which twenty years later, culminated in his condemnation to death."—*Chamber's Encyclopædia*.

With regard to the *Clouds*, *Encyclopædia Britannica* has the following:—"This play would be correctly described as an attack on the new spirit of intellectual inquiry and culture rather than on a school or class. Two classes of thinkers or teachers are, however, specially satirized under the general name of 'Sophist' (V.331)—1. The Physical Philosophers—indicated by allusions to the doctrines of Anaxagoras, Heraclitus and Diogenes of Apollonia. 2. The professed teachers of rhetoric, belles letters, etc., such as Protagoras and Prodicus. Socrates is taken as the type of entire tendency. A youth named Pheidippides—obviously meant for Alcibiades—is sent by his father to Socrates to be cured of his dissolute propensities. Under the discipline of Socrates the youth becomes accomplished in dishonesty and impiety. The conclusion of the play shows the indignant father preparing to burn up the philosopher and his hall of contemplation."

Swinging in a basket...less: These are some of the misrepresentations.

Note.—Taking into consideration that the *Clouds* appeared in 423, and the vilification that appeared therein was the cause of subsequent persecution of the

philosopher for nearly a quarter of a century, it is natural that the minds of the Athenians must have been overcharged with prejudice, which Socrates tries to remove before starting his actual defence against the charges.

Disparage—Undervalue ; to treat with detraction or in a depreciatory manner. O. Fr. *desparager* to offer to a woman, or impose on her a husband, a man unfit or unworthy ; to impose unworthy conditions.—prefix, *des* for *dis*, and *parage* equality, from L. *par* equal [whence also *peer*, *pair*.]

Prosecute—To seek to obtain punishment for an offender by a court of law. To *prosecute* also means to pursue : *e. g.*, to *prosecute* one's studies. L. *pro* before, *sequor* to follow.

For that—For that sort of knowledge.

These matters, such as those imputed to me by Aristophanes.

My witnesses—Those who can give testimony or evidence on my behalf in a judicial proceeding.

Converse—Talk ; hold discourses. L. *con*, and *versor* to be engaged in anything, from *verts versum*, to turn.

Neighbours—Those that live or sit near. A. S. *neah* nigh, (the positive form of next) near, and *bur* or *gebur*,—a husbandman, a dweller.

Either more or less—Whether it is to any greater extent than is given out by the play, or to any extent, howsoever small. The idea is, I have never spoken so to any extent whatever,

That—The informing of your neighbours about this matter. What Socrates means is this: There are many of you who have heard me conversing, and thus know I have never uttered such nonsense. Will such of you, then, inform those who sit close to you, so that they too might know that such a story about me is all false. When one such thing is false, other things will be equally so.

Stories—Fictitious narrations. *Story* is a contracted form of *history*.

IV. SOCRATES NEVER TOOK AIRS OF A TEACHER.

Educate—To train the intellect, or other powers, qualify one to a particular purpose; train. *L'* *e* out, and *duco* I lead.

‘**Exact**—Extract by force; to extort. *L. ex* out and *ago* to drive. Socrates, as will be seen, was not charging any money to those who would come to listen to his discourses, and he considers the profession of teaching that was then common in Athens, for which fees had to be given, was not a proper one. Another thing that is hinted here is that he does not ‘educate’ men in the sense in which it is commonly understood, but was only holding discourses for the purpose of arriving at the truth.

That is not true either—Nor is that a correct account; that is equally a fabricated story against me.

‘**Fine thing**—Excellent thing. *L. finitus* finished or perfect. As it will be seen from the account of men, Socrates refers to here, it will be seen that the profession of teaching—

(1) would give influence to one;

(2) would give him the company of good young men; and

✓ (3) make his finance a success.

✓ **Gorgias of Leontini** (483-375 B. C.) Greek sophist and rhetorician, was a native of Leontini. In 427, he was sent by his fellow citizens at the head of an embassy to ask Athenian protection against the aggression of Syracurans. He subsequently settled in Athens, and supported himself by the practice of oratory and by teaching rhetoric. His chief claim to recognition consists in the fact that he transplanted rhetoric to Greece, and contributed to the diffusion of the Attic dialect as the language of literary prose. Leontini was a town in province of Syracuse in Italy.

Prodicus of Ceos (born about B. C. 450), was a Greek humanist of the first period of the sophistical movement, and is known as the "precursor of Socrates." He was still living in 399 B. C., the year of the prosecution of Socrates. He came to Athens as an ambassador from Ceos and became known as a speaker and teacher. Like Protagoras, he professed to train his pupils for domestic and civic affairs; but it would appear that while Protagoras' chief instruments of education were rhetoric and style, Prodicus made ethics prominent in his curriculum. (In ethics he was a pessimist). His views on the origin of the belief in the gods is strikingly modern. His chief interest is that he sought to give precision to the use of words.

Hippias of Elis, Greek sophist, was born about the middle of the fifth century, and was thus a younger contemporary of Protagoras and Socrates. He was a man of great vitality, and won the respect of his fellow citizens to such an extent that he was sent to various towns on important embassies. At Athens he made the acquaintance of Socrates and other leading thinkers. With an assurance characteristic of the later sophists he claimed to be regarded as an authority on all subjects, and lectured, at all events with financial success, on poetry, grammar, history, politics, archæology, mathematics, and astronomy. He boasted that he was more popular than Protagoras, and was prepared at any moment to deliver an extempore address on any subject to an assembly at Olympia. Of his ability there is no question, but it is equally certain that he was superficial. His aim was not to give knowledge, but to provide his pupils with the weapons of argument, and to make them fertile in discussion on all subjects alike.

Elis was an ancient city north-west of Morea in Greece.

Can go to any city: Reference is to their having come to Athens from different places and settled there very securely. Socrates intends to say that they may

go to some other place, but still they know how to command the same situation.

Any city—Notice, Athens was a city-state, for so very little was its area. What he means is to any state. *Fr. cite* from *L. civitas, civitatis* a city, state, from *civis* a citizen. *Civil* is also from the same root.

Persuade—Influence by arguing, reasoning, etc., to a particular course of action. *L. per* effectively, *suades* to advise, urge.

The society of their fellow-citizens—The company of the people born in their own state.

With whom they might associate for nothing: *Associate, ad* to, *socius* a companion. The root here is *sequor* to follow. *Society* is from the same root.

Privilege—A special advantage. *L. Privus* separate, *lex* law.

Notice the humour here. It means to hint that Athens is not wanting in wise men with whom young men might associate themselves and learn without any loss to their pocket, and, nevertheless, they take a peculiar fancy to run and seek the society of these foreign people who call themselves wise. Such young men pay them handsomely, and consider that they are specially fortunate in securing the company of those "wise men."

That wisdom at the hands of such was a were delusion can be seen from the following: "When the demand for an art of conduct made itself felt, it was natural that the rhetoricians, skilled as they were in handling the accepted notions and principles of practice, should come forward to furnish the supply. Nor is there any reason to regard them as conscious charlatans for so doing, any more than the professional journalist of our own day, whose position as a political instructor of mankind is commonly earned rather by a knack of ready writing than by any special depth of political wisdom. As Plato's *Protagoras* says, the sophists, in professing to teach virtue, only claimed to do somewhat better than

others what all men are continually doing ; and similarly we may say that, when tried by the touchstone of Socrates they only exhibited somewhat more conspicuously than others the deficiencies which the great questioner found everywhere."—SIDGWICK.

I believe—I have reasons to hope. This shows he was acquainted with that sophist.

[PAGE 40.]

Paros—is an island in the Ægean sea, and produces finest marbles.

At this moment.—At the present time,

Callias.—The son of Hipponicus, the black sheep of the family, was notorious for his profligacy and extravagance, and was ridiculed by the comic poets as an example of a degenerate Athenian. He was reduced to a state of absolute poverty, and, according to Ælian, committed suicide. In spite of his dissipated life, he played a certain part in public affairs. In 392 he was in command of the Athenian hoplites at Corinth, and in 371 he was at the head of the embassy sent to make terms with Sparta. The peace which was the result was called after him the "peace of Callias."

Hipponicus, the father of Callias, was slain at the battle of Delium (424 B. C.).

Trainer.....nature: What Socrates means here is, that there is a particular quality in each individual and that must be understood and trained to a degree of excellence. His example of foals and calves goes to show that this nature is individual rather than common to all alike. Next he throws a hint that there is a difference between the nature that is found in men and that found in citizens. The art of teaching is extremely difficult, therefore, and that is why Socrates expresses his wonder if Evenus had really understood this art, and if he had, he must then be a fortunate man.

N. B.—The interest of the topic is more heightened when it is noticed what a sort of man Callias himself actually was, and what then the capacity could have been to judge the capacity of one who could be a trainer of faculties.

Minae.—Mina was a price of money valued at 100 drachmas. A drachma is worth a French franc, 25·22 francs being equivalent to an English pound. Therefore a mina was worth slightly less than £ 4 but the author's note on p. 72, text-book gives it as £ 4-1-3.

✓ V. THE DECLARATION OF THE ORACLE.

Perhaps.—Possibly. *L. Per* by (as in *perchance*), and *E. hap.* Thus a hybrid word.

Reply : O. Fr. *replicier* to reply, from *L. replico* to fold back, to reply—*re* back, and *plico* to fold. Thus to reply to give answer to one man when he comes forward with an argument. It is a "distinct response to a formal question or attack in speech or writing." Sometimes when one tries to refute the arguments, etc., of another, the latter will have to maintain his ground by counter-arguments, and that is called a *rejoinder*. A *rejoinder* is, therefore, a second reply, that is, a reply to a reply in a protracted discussion or controversy. The word *answer*, of course, has a slightly altered sense. It is used in the most general sense of a mere response ; *e. g.*, the *answer* to a question, and also it is used in the sense of a decision and satisfactory confutation of an adversary's argument, *e. g.*, a triumphant *answer* to the speech or accusation of an adversary.

Pursuit.—Following of a particular course ; avocation. The word comes through French (*poursuite*), the Latin derivation being *per* forward, and *sequor* to follow.

Calumnies.—False accusations calculated to injure another ; malicious or slanderous misrepresentations. Cf.

'Be thou as chaste as ice, as pure as snow, thou shalt not escape calumny.'—*Hamlet*.

Out of the common.—Beyond the pale of what is recognized or accepted by the people at large.

N. B.—Notice the use of the common. It means an enclosed or an unenclosed tract of ground for pleasure, or pasturage, etc., the use of which belongs to the public or to a number of persons. Thus *to be out of the common* is to be beyond something which in general belongs to the public.

Reports.—Statements of an unfavourable nature made against the conduct or behaviour of another, e. g., I will *report* this conduct of yours to the authorities. Both the words *story* and *report* have this sense of being unfavourable.

Would not have gone about.—Would never have gained currency; would never have been spread. *To go about* is to move from place to place.

Different.—Not of the same sort. *Difference* is often used to mean a controversy or even a slight quarrel. Cf.

"What was the *difference*? It was a contention in public."—SHAKES.

"Away, therefore, went I with the constable, leaving the old warden and the young constable to compose their *difference* as they could."—B. ELLWOOD.

Verdict.—Opinion. *Verdict* in law means "the answer of a jury given to the court concerning any matter of fact in any cause, civil or criminal, committed to their examination and determination." (WEBSTER). The decision of a judge or referee upon an issue of fact is not called a *verdict*, but a *finding* or a *finding of fact*.

In the dark.—Without being fully informed of the facts; without proper knowledge and discrimination.

Fair.—Just; characterized by honest impartiality. *Fair* is often used in the sense of *not bad* and of a thing which cannot directly be called *good*.

Raised.—Given cause to; excited.

• • **Jesting**—Speaking only to cause merriment and not with a serious notion of defending himself.

N. B.—A *jest* and a *joke* are thus distinguished. A *joke* is quite a harmless thing, and one *jokes* only to please himself and in good humour without in any way wounding the feeling of others, and particularly the object of the *joke*. But a *jest* is calculated to excite laughter in others and is often ill-natured and done at the expense of others. "*Jests* are, therefore, seldom harmless, and *jokes* frequently allowable. The most serious object may be degraded by being turned into a *jest*."—CRABBE.

Gained this name—Attained this reputation.

By reason of—On account of. *Reason* is from Fr. *raison*, O. Fr. *raison*, from L. *ratio*, *rationis*, plan, account, from *recor*, *ratus*, to think, to calculate.

Certain,—A kind of. He says *certain*, because the nature of it cannot exactly be defined.

✱ **Wisdom** "has been defined to be the use of the best means for attaining the best ends." "We conceive," says WHEWELL, "prudence as the virtue by which we select right means for given ends, while *wisdom* implies the selection of right ends as well as of right means." "Hence," says WEBSTER, "*wisdom* implies the union of high mental and moral excellence." "In strictness of language," says PALEY, "there is a difference between *knowledge* and *wisdom*; *wisdom* always supposing action, and action directed by it." The following lines of COWPER may be noted :

Knowledge and *wisdom*, far from being one,
How oft times no connection. *Knowledge* dwells
In heads replete with thoughts of other men ;
Wisdom in minds attentive to their own.
Knowledge, a rude, unprofitable mass,
The mere materials with which *wisdom* builds,
Till smoothed, and squared, and fitted to its place
Does but encumber whom it seems to enrich.

✱ *Knowledge* is proud that he has learned so much
Wisdom is humble that he knows no more.
Just—Exactly.

Possible to all men : Socrates tries to answer here that the wisdom he possesses is in no way different from that which is possible to all men, though the evil reports against him may suggest to them that he was engaged in some pursuit out of the common.

In that—In possessing that wisdom.

The men.....just now—The sophists.

N. B.—Socrates tries to draw a line here between his wisdom and the wisdom which the sophists pretended to possess. He says that the knowledge he possesses is possible to be common to all mankind, whereas the wisdom claimed by the sophists is either of a super-human nature or of a nature which one cannot understand.

It—That sort of knowledge which the sophists claim to possess, and which they have established themselves well in the profession of teaching.

Slander—A false tale or report maliciously uttered. Formerly *slander* meant defamation in general, whether oral or written, and nowadays it becomes defamation by words spoken, while written defamation is called *libel*.

Interrupt—Stop (me) in the middle of my speech.
L. *inter* amongst *rumpere*—to break.

Arrogantly—Haughtily ; giving one's own self an undue degree of importance.

Worthy of your credit—Fit for being relied upon by you. *Credit* is from the Latin root *credere* to trust, believe. By 'he' he means, the god of Delphi in whom they all implicitly believe.

God of Delphi : Delphi was a town in Phocis (ancient Greece) containing the oracle of Apollo. It is said that a priest would be inspired and answer the questions of various devotees that sought an answer from God, particularly with regard to future events or the success or otherwise of great undertakings. But the responses of

the Oracle often seem to have been ambiguous, and as an instance, the following may be noted :—

(1) Cræsus once consulted the Oracle at Delphi respecting the projected war and the response was :—
 “When Cræsus passes over the river Halys, he will overthrow the strength of an empire.” Cræsus supposed that oracle meant that he would overthrow the enemy’s empire, whereas it was his own that he destroyed.

(2) Pyrrhus, while trying to make war against Rome, consulted the oracle whose response was, “I say, Pyrrhus, that you the Romans can conquer,” which may mean either *you can conquer the Romans* or *the Romans can conquer you*.

(3) Another response given to a prince who was about to go to war was, “You shall go shall return never you shall perish by the war,” which may mean, *you shall return never, you shall perish by the war* or *you shall return, never you shall perish by the war*.

(4) Philip of Macedon received the following reply with regard to his Persian expedition :—

“The ready victim crowned for death
 Before the altar stands.”

He took ‘the ready victim’ to mean the king of Persia, but it proved that it was he himself.

(5) The Greeks were once told with regard to their war with the Persians :—

“Seed-time and harvest, weeping-sires shall tell
 How thousands fought at Salamis and fell.”

It is not plain whether the weeping-sires were the Greeks or the Persians.

And there is no doubt that the Greeks had the highest faith in the Delphic Oracle. But on account of such ambiguous or equivocal responses of the Oracle, *delphic* has acquired a sense of ambiguous or mysterious. Cf.,

‘Is he silent or *delphic*?’

To be the witness of the fact.—To testify the fact.

Comrade.—A companion or associate. Sp. *camarada*, from L. *camara*, *camera*, a chamber; hence, a chamber-fellowship, and then a chamber-fellow.

Exile.—A life of forced separation from the country.

N. B.—Socrates says, "you remember Chærephon" for the event of his exile (404 B. C.) had taken place just before five years prior to his own trial. He reminds then of Chærephon's character, so that they may take him as one worthy of belief.

Character.—Moral quality.

"It would be well if *character* and *reputation* were used distinctively. In truth, character is what a person is; reputation is what a person is supposed to be. Character is in himself, reputation is in the minds of others. Character is injured by temptations and by wrong-doing; reputation by slanders and libels. Character endures throughout defamation in every form, but perishes when there is a voluntary transgression; reputation may last through numerous transgressions, but be destroyed by a single, and even an unfounded, accusation or aspersion."—ABBOTT.

Vehement.—Acting with great force and energy. L. *Vehement*, passionate; literally, 'out of one's mind'. SKEAT says that *vehie* has been explained as equivalent to *ve* apart from, as in *vecors*, senseless; cf. Skt. *vahir*, apart, *mens* mind.

Carry through.—Accomplish. *Carry through* rather refers to the accomplishment of the whole work, (not needing any directions for others as in the case of *carry out*), and implies difficulty, resistance, or even delay.

Took in hand.—Undertook to do.

Ventured.—Boldly tried.

To put this question.—To ask this question.

Oracle is from L. *orare* to speak. Hence it meant the answer of a god or some person reputed to have the inspiration of God, and thus came to signify the deity itself who was supposed to give the answer,—an answer from which there could be no appeal.

[Sir Oracle thus came to be a dogmatical person. Cf. SHAKESPEARE,

"I am *Sir Oracle*,
And when I ope my lips, let no dog bark."]

N. B.—The parenthesis *I entreat you, etc.*, is on account of some cry, etc. that might have risen among his hearers at his statement. Such things are found frequently throughout the "Apology."

[PAGE 42.]

The answer of the Priestess was

"Socrates of all the mortals is the wisest."

Confirm—Give an assurance of the truth. L. *con* and *firmare* to make firm.

VI. HOW SOCRATES GREW UNPOPULAR.

Unpopularity—The quality of sinking in the public estimate and incur their displeasure.

Dark—Not clear; obscure.

N. B.—It has been noted above that the responses of the oracle were often ambiguous. Socrates intends to say that this was ambiguous too, for it was a direct contrast to his belief that he knew nothing. He determines to find out the real meaning of the response, his reasons being that God cannot lie and the oracle was God.

At a loss—Not at all able.

Notice *his* and *he* are being used in this connection, though it was a priestess that gave the response. It confirms the belief that it was god that would speak not any mortal, though the latter was inspired.

Reluctantly—Unwillingly. *L. re* back, and *luctor* to struggle.

Seek for it—To search for the meaning.

Reputed—Had the reputation ; known ; generally considered ; commonly believed. *Re*, and *puto* to reckon, to estimate.

There, if anywhere—With regard to any matter in the course of the discourse with him.

± Prove the answer wrong—Establish that the answer given by the Delphic oracle was not a correct one. The idea is—

(1) he wanted to prove that, being defeated in some point of argument or other, the response of the oracle was wrong ; and

(2) intended to show the oracle its mistake.

Politician.—A statesman ; one well-versed in politics ; one experienced in the science of government. Politics is a part of ethics and it comprises—

(1) the regulation and government of a nation or state ;

(2) the preservation of its safety, peace, and prosperity ;

(3) the defence of its existence and rights against foreign control or conquest.

(4) the augmentation of its strength and resources ; and

(5) the protection of the citizens in their rights, and the improvement of their morals.

Conversed—Discoursed.

Great many persons : Notice *great* is an adverb here qualifying the indefinite numeral *many*.

And most of all he himself : This shows how he was great in his own conceit.

I tried to prove to him . To point out to him conclusively.

Fancied—Imagined ; thought without much of reflection.

Bystanders—Spectators ; those who had nothing to do with the matter ; a looker-on.

N. B.—Socrates intends to say that, at his efforts to prove to a supposed wise man that he was not wise as he thought he was, many persons who had believed that that man was wise became his enemies, because it was wounding to their notions, though properly speaking they ought to have had no concern in the matter.

Probably—As it may be the case. *L. probabilis*, from *probare* to try, approve.

I am wiser..... : Socrates considers that he is wise inasmuch as he does not think that he is wise in a matter he does not know.

[PAGE 43.]

Still wiser—Even more wise. *Still* in such cases means in an additional degree.

N. B.—He means to say that in all such cases not only those to whom he went became his enemies, but many others.

VII. SOCRATES AND POETS.

Caused me—Brought about on me.

Much unhappiness and anxiety : He became unhappy because of the treatment of others, and anxiety at his daily increasing enemies. Cf.

“Very often while arguing and discussing points that arose, he was treated with great violence and beaten and pulled about, and laughed and ridiculed by the multitude. But he bore all this with great equanimity, so that once, when he had been kicked and buffeted about, and had borne it all patiently, and some one expressed his surprise, he said, “Suppose an ass had kicked me, would you have had me bring an action

against him?" And this is the account of Demetrius."
—YONGE.

Anxiety, because of the course events were taking, though out of his expectations, and very much to his disappointment.

Verily—In very truth.

By the god of Egypt—A sort of oath.

Lacking in—Wanting.

Look down on—To treat with contempt or low regard.

Fitted—Made capable.

Heracleian labours—Herculean labours; very great toils.

Heracles or Hercules is a Grecian hero possessed of the utmost amount of physical strength and vigour that the human frame is capable of. He is represented as brawny, muscular, short-necked, and of huge proportions. Xenophon says that when Hercules "was young, he was accosted by two women, Pleasure and Virtue, and asked to choose which he would follow. Pleasure promised him all carnal delights, but Virtue promised him immortality. Hercules gave his hand to the latter, and hence led a life of great toil, but was ultimately received amongst the immortals." It is also said that "the Pythian told him if he would serve Eurystheus for twelve years, he should become immortal. Accordingly he bound himself to the Argive king, who imposed upon him twelve tasks of great difficulty and danger, all of which he performed one by one."

Tragic—Those who write tragedies.

A tragedy is that species of a drama which represents the sad or terrible phases of character and life. It is thus a drama having a fatal issue. The origin seems to be that it was originally a goat-song, that is to say, the song that wins the goat as a prize (*Gr. tragos-ode*).

* **Dithyrambic**—Writing dithyrambs. A *dithyramb* is a "kind of lyric poetry in honour of Bacchus, usually sung by a band of revellers to a flute accompaniment." (WEBSTER).

Others, that is, writing poetry distinguished by other names.

Manifestly—Clearly; evidently. Literally, in a manner that may be laid hold of by the hand. *L. manus* the hand, and the root seen in obsolete *fendo* to dash against.

Ignorant—Wanting in knowledge. *L. in* not, *gnarus* knowledge, from root of *gnosco* to know.

On which they had spent most pains—To write which they had exerted themselves very highly.

What they meant—What their idea was.

[PAGE 44.]

Create their works—Produce their works.

Certain natural power—Some unknown power that comes by nature to one.

* **Inspiration**—A sort of influence emanating from an object, giving rise to new and elevated thoughts or emotions. *L. in*, and *spiro* to breathe. Cf.

"The lunatic, the lover, and the poet
Are of imagination all compact :
One sees more devils than vast hell can hold ;
That is the madman : the lover, all as frantic,
Sees Helen's beauty in a brow of Egypt :
The poet's eye, in a fine frenzy rolling,
Doth glance from heaven to earth, from earth to heaven,
And, as imagination bodies forth
The forms of things unknown, the poet's pen
Turns them to shapes, and gives to airy nothing
A local habitation and a name"

—*A Midsummer Night's Dream*, V. I. 7-17.

* **Soothsayers**—Those to who foretell future events. *Sooth* and *say*, which properly means speaking the truth.

* **Prophets**—Those who announce future events under divine inspiration. Gr. *pro* before, *phemi* to speak.

The idea is, that poets, soothsayers, and prophets have all got a sort of divine inspiration under which they write or speak, but do not understand their own writings or speech.

Advantage—Superiority. Fr. *advant* before.

VIII. SOCRATES AND ARTIZANS.

Finally—At last. This goes to show that after his experience with the artizans, Socrates stopped his examining the truth of the oracle by this method.

Artizan (also spelt *artisan*)—One skilled in any mechanical art; a handicraftsman. From L. *ars*, *artis*, an art.

For I knew...knowledge at all: This shows how earnest he must have been. He must naturally have suspected that as he knew something of politics or poetry, he might be in a position to criticize others and find fault with them. Now he goes to the artizans only to test their wisdom in the matter, knowing that he has no knowledge of any art and cannot be inclined with unconscious bias to find mere faults with them.

* **Fine things**—Things of great skill. *N. B.*—Notice the use of *fine* here. He goes to the artizans, or those possessing a knowledge of *fine arts*, that is to say, the arts which depend chiefly on the labours of the mind or imagination.

So far they were wiser than I: He means to say that if they can be called wise because they knew something he did not know, they were wise; but if wisdom meant any other thing, then they were not wise.

Each of...own art: This shows how conceited they were. Of course they had some skill in their own art, but that had made them believe that they were adepts in a variety of other matters, no matter how important

those are and what wisdom it requires to dabble in them.

This mistake...shade—If they had kept aloof from those important matters, then their artizan skill at least would have been more developed. But now, their ignorant meddling with other affairs had dimmed even their artizan skill, and prevented its coming to the front any more.

• Their wisdom or, their ignorance : *Wisdom*, their supposing that they knew all ; *ignorance*, ignorant meddling with every thing else, things of highest importance included.

[PAGE 45.]

• To remain as I was : (1) Not to suppose that I know anything ; and (2) and to refrain from ignorantly meddling with things of greatest importance.

IX. HIS " GOD-APPOINTED MISSION."

Fierce and bitter kind : See the extract quoted from YONGE under *poets* above.

Wise man—A sophist.

Convict—Convince. He intends to say that he convinces other men of their ignorance with regard to certain matters ; that is all. With regard to those matters themselves he knows nothing.

Very truth—Actual truth.

Citizen here means an Athenian, though of course an Athenian was regarded as a citizen at a certain age of his life.

Stranger—A foreigner. O. Fr. *estranger*, from L. *extra* on the outside. Notice the aphæresis of *e*. Compare *squire* which is a contraction of *esquire*.

N. B.—His examining of others still is not to find out what the meaning of the oracle can be, but only to show them that they are ignorant, notwithstanding conceit to the contrary.

On the part of God—On behalf of God. He thinks it is a God-appointed mission that he should convince others of their ignorance, and for that purpose he gave up all that would make him great in public affairs or have enriched him.

[PAGE 46.]

X. SOCRATES AND YOUNG MEN.

Besides this—In addition to this.

Who follow me about—Who go with me here and there. It should not be imagined from this that Socrates was a great traveller. It is not that what he means, but intends to say in going here and there in the city of Athens itself.

"But he had no need of travelling (though most of the philosophers did travel), except when he was bound to serve in the army. But all the rest of his life he remained in the same place, and in an argumentative spirit he used to dispute with all who would converse with him, not with the purpose of taking away their opinions from them, so much as of learning the truth, as far as he could do himself."—YONGE.

Spare time, Because they have very little care and are not obliged to work all the day for the sake of bread.

Natural pleasure—A pleasure which is common among men, so much so that it comes to them by nature.

They try their hands—They try their power; that is, they try how much they can themselves achieve in the matter.

What follows means this: (1) Young men follow him first out of pleasure to hear men cross-examined and learn something of that art. (2) Next they begin to cross-examine other people and try to convince them of their ignorance. (3) Men, if they are wise, ought to blame themselves for their ignorance, but, instead,

they grow angry at me for corrupting young men who startle them.

N. B.—This shows how the method of Socrates was being learnt by other people also. Let it be remembered that Socrates had no dogmas to impart, and he was great as a philosopher because of his method of cross-examination till the truth was discovered.

• *Corrupts young men*: He infused an inquiring spirit into the young men, and that made them not to submit themselves readily to the dogmas of the so-called "wise" or "great" men. That was wounding to the pride of those people, and that made them hate Socrates.

• *What...do? What...teach?*—Their reply to these questions ought to have been (1) he investigates truths, and (2) he teaches nothing.

• *Not to seem at a loss*—So that they may not be suspected as having no answer to give.

Stock charges—Standing or permanent accusations. For this use of *stock* compare, *stock* jest, *stock* play.

N. B.—It appears that in those days the sophists were charged of these things, and Socrates intends to say that they unjustly impute those things to him also.

Allege—Wrongly attribute. From *L. ad*, and *legare* to depute, to announce.

Investigate—Conducts an inquiry into. From *L. n*, and *vestigo* to follow a track, to search. *Vestige* is from the same root.

Things in the air—Celestial bodies, such as the sun, etc. Notice; astronomy was also growing in Greece at about this period, and the people did not like the idea of such investigations. See note on Anaxagoras (page 52, text-book).

To disbelieve in gods—For example, the sun was treated by the people as the god Apollo, and to tell them that it was a shining mass governed by particular

astronomical laws was regarded by them as to make men disbelieve in the gods.

Confess—Admit. L. *con*, and *fateor* to own or acknowledge.

Shown up—Pointed out to.

Pretenders—Those who have no claims to a thing but still proclaim that they have.

Filling your ears—Reporting more and more to you.

Bitter—Reproachful ; severe ; poignant.

Zealous : Notice the significance of the three attributes, *zealous*, *numerous*, and *bitter*, and also his enemies' being *disciplined* and *plausible* in speech, which shows that they can produce the desired effect. *Disciplined* means accomplished ; from L. *disco* to learn. *Disciple* is from the same root.

Indignant—Displeased at what they consider is unworthy or base ; violently displeased. *Indignation* implies anger mingled with contempt, disgust, or abhorrence. L. *in* not, *dignor* to deem worthy. *Dignity* and *deign* are from the same root.

Orators : From *orare* to speak.

[PAGE 47.]

Surprised—Astonished ; struck with wonder.

Conceal, suppress : *Conceal*, L. *con*, and *celare* to hide. Thus to *conceal* is simply not to make known what we wish to keep secret. *Suppress*, L. *sub* under, *premere* to press. To *suppress* is not to disclose. Thus *conceal* implies a sort of desire not to disclose a fact while *suppress*, not to disclose it, that is all.

And yet . . . enemies—Even here I am as plain as I ever was, and also know that this sort of plain-speaking creates many enemies to me.

Look for—Search for.

XI. MELETUS BRINGS MEN LIGHTLY TO TRIAL.

Suffice—Be equal to the end proposed. L. *sub* under, and *facio* to make.

• **Patriot**—One who is zealously attached to his country and supports its interests. Notice *good* is used in the sense of thorough,

• **As he calls himself**: This is an instance of the fact that Socrates contends that many are great in their own conceit but are actually the most ignorant imaginable.

• **Corrupt**: L. *con, rumpo* to break. *Abrupt, disrupt*, are from the same root. The sense of deprave or pervert is, therefore, figurative.

Each point—Each part.

Separately—One by one. L. *se* apart, *paro* to put or place.

N. B.—He now takes the first charge.

• **Play off**—Display. Cf. 'You need not *play off* any of your tricks here.'

Solemn jest—A jest which appears to be solemn. For *jest* see above.

Lightly—In a wanton manner.

In matters to which etc.—In matters of the state importance.

XII. MELETUS CROSS-EXAMINED WITH REGARD TO THE FIRST CHARGE.

[PAGE 48.]

Excellent—Surpassing in good qualities. L. *ex, celsus* raised high.

Come then: *Come* in such cases means speak out.

Improves: Prefix *im* for *in*, an intensitive prefix, and *prover* (O, Fr.) to show to be sufficient.

Reveal—Give out. L. *re* back, and *velo* to veil,

You have nothing to say : *To say* is a gerund qualifying *nothing*.

Scandalous : A *scandal* is a false talk injurious to the character of another ; a defamatory talk.

By Hêrê is a gentle oath. Cf. 'By God,' 'by Jove,' etc.

Good news—Extra news.

Abundance of benefactors—A pretty large number of benefactors.

*** Senators :** The word generally means a body of elders appointed or elected from among the nobles of the nation, and having the supreme legislative authority. In Athens it was a council of state called *Boule*. It was chosen annually by lot to prepare measures for submission to *Ecclesia* or popular assembly in which all classes of people could vote. From L. *senatus* council of elders.

[PAGE 49.]

*** Assembly—**The *Ecclesia*. A body of jurors was annually selected by lot from this assembly. L. *as*-(for *ad*-) to, *simul* together.

X **All the Athenians, etc :** Notice how confused Meletus is. He has to secure conviction against him, and thus he could say nothing against any Athenian lest they may fail to vote against Socrates. He is never more at a loss to answer than when he admits that every Athenian improves young men, while it is only Socrates that corrupts them.

/ **Certainly—Surely ; decidedly.** L. *certus* sure,

Discovered—Found out. *Dis* and *cover*. A word of Latin origin but coming through French.

Unfortunate, because of his being the only man who, as Meletus says, is a black sheep in all Athens.

Now tell me : Socrates now passes to an example.

Same : Notice, here it means a similar thing ; that is, one man corrupting them while every one else is improving them.

X Holds good—Is true ; remains intact. *Stand good* has the same sense. *Hold good* can be seen used in two cases : (1) when there is doubt with regard to a particular statement, and after examination it is found to be correct, it is said to *hold good*, that is, remain intact. (2) A contract is often said to *hold good* when it remains the same or is so made that it is inviolable.

Does one man...them : This is what is represented by *same* above.

On the contrary—On the other hand, F. *contraire*. L. *contrarius* contrary, from *contra* against.

Skilled in horses—Possessed of skill or tact necessary for the management of horses.

Improve : " Formerly *emprove*, for late M. E. *emproven* (Skelton), which was itself an alteration of M. E. *approwen*, to benefit. "—SKEAT. Thus it means to benefit.

Majority—A greater portion. L. *maior* comparative of *magnus* great.

N. B.—The idea is many men cannot dispense with horses and have to use them, with the result that, not being skilled in their management, they spoil them. In the same way, several people have dealings or intercourse with young men, and as all of them are not able to improve them, many are apt to spoil them rather than benefitting them. Thus your admission that all Athenians improve their young men is erroneous.

The young men would, etc. : For, the chances of their being benefitted are many while the chance of their being corrupted is quite negligible.

Conclusively—Without leaving any doubt about the matter. L. *con, cludere* to shut. It thus signifies that the proof is so well made that there is no necessity of re-opening the matter.

The youth—The young men. Notice the collective form.

In your life—In all your life ; ever since you were born up to the present day ; the time you have lived on earth.

Showing—Demonstration ; proof.

The matters, etc : (1) The question of corrupting the young ; and (2) the question of disbelief in the gods.

XIII. SOCRATES PROVES THAT MELETUS IS A LIAR AS REGARDS THE CHARGES.

Be so good : Notice *good* here means serviceable or kind.

Citizen ; O. F. *citain* (F. *citoyen*) formed from the O. F. *cite* city, by the help of the adjective suffix *ain*, which appears as *anc* (L. *anus*) in *humane*, *mundane*, etc. In middle English it was *citesein* from A. F. *citisein*, in which *s* was an insertion.

Friend : Familiar form of address.

I am not asking etc. : The question is a very easy one and you can answer it without any difficulty.

[PAGE 50.]

Rather—Sooner. It is a comparative form of *rath*, soon, early.

Injured—From L. *ini* not, *inr*, for *iur* (*jus*), law, right. Thus, to be wronged or done harm to.

Benefitted : L. *bene* well, and *facere* to make. The modification is rather bad.

Obliged—Bound.

Notice the idea running through these sentences:

(1). Bad citizens do harm to their neighbours and good citizens good.

(2). One would rather be benefitted than injured by his neighbour or associate.

(3). How, then, can he corrupt others only to be done harm to by them, when he expects them be good and benefit him?

This shows he had no intention of corrupting young men. He next wants to show that if young men were actually being corrupted by him, then there was no intention on his part, and for an unintentional act there was no punishment prescribed by the laws of Athens.

Intentionally—Voluntarily. L. *intendere* to stretch to, bind or apply the mind to, to design. L. *in* to, *tendere* to stretch. *To intend* thus means to work with a purpose and expect the result.

Extraordinarily—More than in the ordinary degree; beyond what is ordinary. L. *extra* beyond, *ordinarius* ordinary.

Stupid—Senseless. L. *stupere* to be amazed.

Rogue—A deliberately dishonest person.

N. B.—The phrase *rogues and vagabonds* is applied to a class of wandering, disorderly, or dissolute persons. It may be noted also, for the sake of curiosity, that they were once very severely punished by being whipped and having the gristle of the right ear bored with a hot iron.

In some way—In one or the other.

The idea is this: I do not want to be done wrong by any man; a rogue does me wrong in some way; how can I make one a rogue intentionally?

Call upon—Require. It also means pray. Cf.

"Call upon Me in the day of trouble; I will deliver thee."—
ENG. BIR.

Either case: 1st. 'I do not corrupt young men at all.' Your charge is that I do corrupt them and you are a liar;

2nd. 'I do not corrupt young men intentionally even if I corrupt them.' You now say that I corrupt them intentionally and you are a liar.

Involuntary—Not guided by volition or will. L. *In* not, *volens* willing.

Take aside: To take one to a little distance from the rest. *Aside*=*a*+*side*, *a* being equal to *on* or *towards*. *Aside* often appears in the dramas as a stage direction in the sense of 'so as not to be heard by others.' Cf.

.. "The lords and ladies spoke *aside*."—SIR W. SCOTT.

Admonish—Reprove gently, though seriously. L. *ad*, *monere* to warn.

N. B.—It may be noted that *admonition* is prospective, and relates to moral delinquencies. Its object is to prevent any further recurrence of the same mistake. *Reproof*, however, is retrospective and is the act of a superior. It is authoritative fault-finding or censure addressed to children or to inferiors.

Instruct—Teach the right conduct. L. *in* in, *sternere* pile up, build. It thus means a heaping together of good instruction in the minds of another.

[PAGE 51.]

Punishment in law means penalty inflicted by a Court of Justice on a convicted offender as a just retribution, and incidentally for the purposes of reformation and prevention. The word is akin to L. *pœna* penalty.

XIV. SOCRATES MAKES MELETUS UNABLE TO MAINTAIN HIS GROUND IN THE MATTER OF THE SECOND CHARGE.

N. B.—Now he cross-examines Meletus with regard to the other charge.

—Divinities—Deities. It is seen used in the sense of God and also in the sense of inferior gods, which may be called God's agents. Cf.

"'Tis the *divinity* that stirs within us."—ADDISON.

"God.....employing these subservient *divinities*."—CHEYNE.

It is also seen used in the sense of a false god:
Cf.

"Beastly *divinities* and droves of gods."—PRIOR.

Instead—In place of. It stands for *in stead*, *stead* being the A. S. *stede* a place.

In the name of these gods: A form of oath. It is perhaps used to make Meletus nervous, as it has a double purpose to serve:

(1) Meletus cannot explain anything about the gods, and thus his charge becomes ineffectual as he himself knows nothing of what he is speaking.

(2) If Meletus has brought the charge out of malice, then this oath will deter him from uttering falsehood in addition.

Explain: L. *ex* thoroughly, *planare* to make plain, (literally, to flatten, from *planus* flat).

• **Absolute atheism**—Not believing in any god whatsoever. *Absolute* means complete (L. *ab* from, *soluere* to loosen). *Atheism* is a word coined from G. *atheos* denying the gods, without a god (*a* is a negative prefix, *theos* a god, and the suffix *ism*). Hence it means a complete denying the gods.

[PAGE 52.]

I swear he does not: This is said as a sort of answer to Socrates' question "In the name of the gods," *etc.*

N. B.—This is another instance of the fact that when they fail to give a right answer they repeat the "stock charges against all philosophers" (See text book, p. 46). The theory that "the sun is a stone, *etc.*," is not Socrates', and nevertheless, it is attributed to him because some other philosopher, Anaxagoras, held it.

Do you think...Anaxagoras: Do you think that I am Anaxagoras? The idea is, you attribute to me the theory that is propounded by Anaxagoras, and, how-
ever, that is not mine.

XAnaxagoras : Born about 500 B. C. in Asia Minor, and went to Athens solely for the purpose of leading an intellectual life. Pericles learned to love and admire him, and the poet Euripides derived from him an enthusiasm for science and humanity. Some authorities assert that even Socrates was among his disciples. "His influence was due partly to his astronomical and mathematical eminence, but still more to the ascetic dignity of his nature and his superiority to ordinary weaknesses. . . . It was he who brought philosophy and the spirit of scientific inquiry from Iona to Athens. His observations of the celestial bodies led him to form new theories of the universal order, and brought him into collision with the popular faith. He attempted not without success to give a scientific account of eclipses, meteors, rainbows, and the sun, which he described as a mass of blazing metal, larger than Peloponnesus; *the heavenly bodies were masses of stone torn from the earth and ignited by rapid rotation.* The ignorant polytheism of the time could not tolerate such explanation, and the enemies of Pericles used the superstitions of their countrymen as a means of attacking him in the person of his friend. Anaxagoras was arrested on a charge of contravening the established dogmas of religion, (some say the charge was Medism), and it required all the eloquence of Pericles to secure his acquittal. Even so he was forced to retire from Athens to Lampsacus (434-33) where he died about 428 B. C., honoured by the whole city."—*The Encyclopædia Britannica*.

N. B.—Notice the italicized portion in the above passage. That was the theory of Anaxagoras, but was still imputed to Socrates in the Court of Law.

. What follows is a gentle chiding to Meletus and a warning to the judges that they must not mistake him for Anaxagoras.

. Buy places in the theatre—Pay for a visitor's seat in the theatre.

Laugh to scorn—To laugh in a deriding manner. Notice the construction of *to scorn* here.

Doctrines—Tenets. *Doctrine* denotes whatever is recommended as a speculative truth to the belief of others. It supposes a teacher; *e. g.*, doctrines of Buddhism. *L. doctor* a teacher, from *docere* to teach.

Complete atheist : Vide *absolute atheism*, above.

Insolent, wanton : *Insolent* in its primitive sense (*L. in* riot, *solere* to be accustomed, to be wont) simply denoted *unusual*, and to act *insolently* was to act in violation of the established rules of social intercourse. He who did this was *insolent*. And thus the word became one of the most offensive in the English language indicating gross disregard for the feelings of others: (WEBSTER.) *Wanton* is wandering from normal rectitude. In Middle English, it meant unrestrained or not educated. *M. E.* Prefix *wan* lacking, and the *A. S. teon* to draw or educate. (SKEAT). Hence the two words together mean unrestrained acting with gross disregard to the feelings of others.

Of youth—Characteristic of a young man.

Experiment—Trial. *L. experiri* to make a thorough trial. *Experience* (knowledge due to trial) is from the same root.

Riddle—Something proposed to be solved by guessing or conjecture; a puzzle.

Contradicting—Speaking against what one has already said. *L. contra* against, and *dicere* to speak.

Outwit—To surpass by employing cunningness; to defeat by craft.

[PAGE 53.]

But who believes in the gods—Of course Meletus did not admit that Socrates believed in the gods in any way, but his answer which was neither right nor to the purpose shows how he was unable to maintain his ground

in the argument. Thus Socrates points out to the Athenians that

(1). Meletus says he did not believe in the gods ; and

(2) his answer shows that it is quite the contrary.

XV. TO BELIEVE IN THE DIVINITIES IS TO BELIEVE IN THE GODS.

Absurd—Foolish or ridiculous. *L. ab* from, *surdus* deaf, inaudible, harsh. *Absurd* connotes an opposition to the accepted notions of propriety and truth.

N. B.—The gist of the argument is that a thing effected always presupposes an active agent.

Divine beings old or new : The sworn information of Meletus on which the trial proceeded was : " Socrates is guilty inasmuch as he does not believe in the gods whom the city worships, but introduces other strange deities, *etc.*" (see note on *accusers*, I, above). Though he contradicts himself now, yet Socrates proceeds on that solemn affirmation.

Deposition—Something given in writing, on solemn affirmation, as his testimony.

[PAGE 54.]

Children of gods : The Greeks attributed all human qualities to the gods, who, according to them, had wives and children.

Riddle : He now shows how it is a riddle. Sometimes they say he believes in the gods, and at other times, he does not believe. Hence a puzzle.

N. B.—In Grecian mythology, gods are often represented to move side by side with men, and have all sorts of intercourses with them. Some who were born men were often made gods, e. g., Hercules. The gods too associated themselves with nymphs, *etc.*, and raised children on them. This will help to understand what follows.

Illegitimate—Begotten in an unlawful way or out of wedlock.

Nymphs (literally young women,) were in classical mythology goddesses of the mountains, forests, meadows, or waters.

Any crime.....truth—Any crime or criminal offence I have truly committed and for which you can indict me.

Contrive—Form by an exercise of ingenuity, invent, *Con*, and *trouver* to find.

Persuade—To influence by argument or by any similar reason. L. *per*, *suadere* to advise.

Necessarily : L. *neesse* unavoidable.

XVI. DUTY IS THE FIRST CONCERN IN ANY CASE.

Committed—Done ; perpetrated.

The other sense of *commit* may also be noticed. *Commit* is the widest term, and may express only the general idea of delivering into the charge of another ; as to commit a lawsuit to the care of an attorney ; or it may have a special sense of interesting with or without limitations, as to a superior power, or to a careful servant, or of consigning, as to writing or paper, to the flames, or to prison.—WEBSTER.

[PAGE 55.]

Incurred—L. *in* upon, *currere* to run. Thus it means to bring down upon one's own self.

Condemnation—Judicial pronouncing of punishment upon. L. *con*, *damnare* to condemn. The root is the same as in *damn*.

Suspicion—L. *sus* (*sub*) under, *specere* to look. Thus, it is to hold one with mistrust.

Multitude—A great number of persons. L. *multus* any, *tudo* is the suffix.

Notice, he says that many had met a similar fate before him and he is not at all afraid that he is the last in the list.

Victim—A person destroyed for the gratification of another's passion or the like. *L. victima* a victim.

But whether he is, etc : *But* here means with the exception of (the fact that he is, etc).

Grievously—Painfully.

Demigods—Half-gods or inferior deities, the offsprings of a deity and a mortal.

Troy—An ancient ruined city in Asia Minor, about 8 miles south of the Dardanelles. That was the scene of the Trojan war described by HOMER in his *Iliad*.

Thetis was the mother of Achilles. She was a sea-nymph, daughter of Nereus the sea-god.

Hector, eldest son of Priam, the noblest and most magnanimous of all the chieftains in Homer's *Iliad*. After holding out for ten years, he was slain by Achilles, who lashed him to his chariot, and dragged the dead body in triumph thrice round the walls of Troy.

Patroclus: Achilles (son of Thetis) was the king of Myrmidons (in Thessaly), and is the hero of Homer's *Iliad*. He is represented as brave and relentless. The poem begins with a quarrel between him and Agamemnon, the commander-in-chief of the allied Greeks ; in consequence of which Achilles refused to go to battle. The Trojans prevail, and Achilles sends forth his friend Patroclus to oppose them. Patroclus fell ; and Achilles, in anger, rushing into the battle killed Hector, the commander of the Trojans. He himself, according to later poems, fell in battle a few days afterwards, before Troy was taken.

This also explains why he was burning to slay Hector.

Straightway—Immediately ; without loss of time ; without delay.

Scorned—Treated with contempt.

Live a coward : Notice the construction. *Coward* is a noun in the nominative case forming the subjective complement of the verb of incomplete predication, *live*.

Avenge—To take vengeance upon ; to be revenged. *F a* (L. *ad*) to, *vengier* to avenge. The word is thus through French.

[PAGE 56.]

Beaked : A nautical term.

Scorn of men—Object of men's scorn.

Encumbering—Making it unnecessarily heavy. *F en* (L. *in*), *cumber* to hinder.

Post—Position ; rank.

XVII. SOCRATES WOULD NOT CHANGE HIS COURSE OF LIFE AT ANY COST.

N. B.—Historical references in this section are :

432—29 B. C. Socrates serves as a hoplite (heavy armed foot soldier) at Potidæa.

424 B. C. Serves at Delium as a hoplite.

422 B. C. Serves at Amphipolis as a hoplite.

Potidæa—A city in Macedonia near modern Pinaka on the isthmus joining Cassandra Peninsula to the mainland.

Amphipolis was a town in Turkey in Europe. It was important in ancient history.

Delium was an ancient sea-port in Bœotia, a part of Greece.

Ran the risk of—Exposed myself to danger.

Notice the difference. Socrates intends to say that when men were his commanders, he exposed himself to danger ; but now it is God that has placed him in his present situation, and he will never disobey Him, no matter what the consequences will be.

[PAGE 57.]

Different from the mass of mankind—Holding a view contrary to that held in general by mankind at large.

Acquit—Discharge.

All your children, etc. Cf. p. 46, text book, where young men are described to follow Socrates and try their hands at cross-examining other people.

Forthwith—Immediately. Hardly will he have been acquitted here when off he goes to corrupt young men as before.

Pursuit—A course of occupying one's self.

Search of yours—Search of knowledge by examining himself and others. See p. 56.

N. B.—What follows shows his strong determination never to give up his search after philosophical knowledge. He says if he is offered

(1) pardon without philosophy, or

(2) death for philosophy,

he would choose the second at all costs.

Breath—Life.

Exhorting—Inciting by words ; urging by arguments. L. *ex* out, *hortari* to incite, to encourage.

[PAGE 58.]

Wont—Accustomed ; used.

Excellent—Surpassing others in good qualities. L. *ex* out, and the root is that found in *culmen* top, height.

Reputation is public esteem or good name. Cf.

"My *reputation* is at stake."—SHAKES.

Honour is consideration or veneration shown to worth. Cf.

"A prophet is not without *honour* save in his own country."

It may also be noted that *honour* is used in the sense of strict conformity imposed by conscience, position, or privilege. Cf.

" Say ' what is *honour* ? ' 'Tis the finest sense
Of justice which the human mind can frame,
Intent each lurking frailty to disclaim,
And guard the way of life from all offence
Suffered or done."—WORDSWORTH.

Perfection of your soul : Here is a hint that several were making a vain display of their supposed knowledge.

Release—To set free ; O. Fr. *relaisser* to set free. The idea is that he would worry him with more questions rather than stopping the discussion itself.

Reproach—Censure severely ; upbraid. L. *Re* again, *propies* nearer.

Setting the lower value—For understanding things in such a way as is exactly opposite of what it should be.

To every one whom I meet—This shows he had no consideration of the position, etc., occupied by men.

[PAGE 59.]

To die many times—To endure a punishment many times as severe as death.

N. B.—This section gives a vivid picture of the life the great philosopher lived. The chief points to be noted are :—

(1) From the beginning he has preferred death to failure in duty ;

(2) he would not think himself wise without being wise ;

(3) he would cross-examine every one without any consideration of his position, and would not let him go unless he convinced him of his hollow knowledge ; and

(4) his chief concern was perfection of soul rather than thinking of body or wealth.

XVIII. SOCRATES' PLACE IS NOT EASY TO FILL.

Profit you—Benefit you ; be of use to you. L. *pro* forward, *facere* to make.

Inclined—Disposed. L. *in* towards, *clinare* to lean.

To cry out—To shout out.

N. B.—He means that when he says that his death will be a loss to Athens, they may be disposed to express their disapproval and shout out, as, "no", "Athens will be rid of a monster," and so on.

Meletus and Anytus, etc. : Notice his view of things though they are trying to secure his condemnation.

Great evils—Harm done to another to a surpassingly great extent.

To put a man to death—(Here) to secure a capital punishment against him.

His gift—Socrates himself, who is the gift of God to Athens.

Attack—To begin a controversy with ; to criticise. Notice this use of the word.

Quaint—Fanciful ; ingeniously devised.

Sluggish—Full of sloth ; lazily disposed. *From* denotes 'on account of'. The idea is that just as a fatty animal is disposed to be lazy, so Athens which was growing every day in all directions has now become lethargic, and requires to be roused.

[PAGE 60.]

Gadfly—A kind of insect that makes animals uneasy. Care should be taken to understand that Socrates was a gadfly so far as he would rouse men from lethargy, but not in creating sores, etc.

Settling upon : The comparison is with the settling of gadflies on the bodies of animals.

All day long : For that was the only occupation of Socrates.

Easily find any one else ; For no one can consent to sacrifice his own interest and give you his whole day.

To fill my place—To find out another man who will do exactly as I am doing.

Vexed—Irritated. L. *vexare* to vex.

Drowsy—Persons overpowered by sleep. Notice the simile.

Single blow—Without much effort. Here it only consists in their voting against him.

Gained any advantage—Benefitted in any way ; had any sort of personal gain.

Blushing—Feeling a sensation of shame.

Effrontery—Shamefacedness ; barefaced assurance ; impudence. L. *ex, frons* thefor ehead.

This section gives another fact with regard to the way of life lived by Socrates, *viz.*,

He improved others without being materially profited in return.

XIX. WHO WOULD FIGHT FOR JUSTICE MUST DO SO
AS A PRIVATE MAN.

[PAGE 61.]

Going about—To go here and there.

In private—As a private-man, and not as a public man.

Counsel—Advice ; instruction.

Assembly : It must be taken here to mean a gathering to deliberate over public questions.

Public councils : Notice the use of public here. Cf. *public* offices.

Speak of—Speak by way of assigning.

For this—For not coming forward in public to take part in public questions.

Divine sign : *Sign* here means indication. Thus the phrase means manifestation of divine will. It is said *a certain divine sign* because of the difficult nature of exactly communicating his experience of it to others.

Caricatured—Represented with ridiculous exaggeration. It is a word of Italian origin where *caricatura* means a satirical picture, so called because it is exaggerated or 'overloaded.' Ital. *caricare* to load, burden, Late L. being *caricare* to load a car. Charge is from the same root.

N. B.—*Caricature* as is understood nowadays is a picture or other figure or description in which the peculiarities of a person or thing are so exaggerated as to look ridiculous ; e.g. history of the word in *caricature*.

From childhood—From his childhood, that is, ever since he was a child. This is an instance of the fact that great men are always under the influence of an inspiration.

A kind of voice—A sort of information which I hear as it were in my mind's ear.

Turns me back from—Dissuades me from.

Forbids—Prevents. *For* and *bid*, that is, to bid against.

Perished—Lost ; dead. L. *perire* to come to naught ; *per* used with a destructive force like E. *for* in *fordo*, and *ire* to go.

N. B.—This shows that the game of politics is a very dangerous one.

Without doing any good : He means this :

(1) I would have done good to you by introducing more justice and lawful methods to the administration ; and

(2) that would have given me the satisfaction of having improved you and the state.

Opposes—Takes a hostile view.

The commission—The committing or doing.

Must do so : *So* is equivalent to must fight for justice.

Not in public—Not in the capacity of a public or state servant. ✓

XX. REFERENCE TO LEON THE SALAMINIAN.

This is so : He who fights for justice must do so as a private man.

To do wrong from fear : *From* here is equivalent to on account of.

[PAGE 62.]

Commonplace—Ordinary ; trite, e. g. a *common-place* person or observation.

Nevertheless—Notwithstanding. *Never, the, and less.*

Note. Such words as *nevertheless, because, therefore,* etc., are often treated as conjunctions, and thus have no place in the analysis of a sentence containing any such. But that, however, is not quite correct, inasmuch as such words are thoroughly adverbial in character, and are, therefore, to be parsed as such. See MASON.

Senator : That was in the year 406 B. C.

Presidency—The office of a president. See introduction in the text-book.

Illegal action—The action of trying the generals in a body.

Suspend me—To hinder me from proceeding ; to debar me from the privileges of the office for the time being. *L. sus* (same as *sub*) under, and *pendere* to hang.

Arrest—Take or seize by authority of law.

Note. After this word SHAKESPEARE uses *of*: "To arrest thee of high treason." But nowadays *for* is used after the word ; e. g. to arrest one *for* murder.

Clamouring—Shouting out loudly and repeatedly. L. *Clamare* to cry out.

Submit—Yield ; give up resistance. L. *sub* under, *mittere* to let down.

To face out—To expose himself to.

Democracy—A form of government in which the supreme authority is reserved by the people themselves and the executive constituted by popular representation and vested with powers, though the body itself is renewed periodically. Gr. *demos* people, *Kratos* strength, power.

Oligarchy—A form of Government in which the Government is in the hands of a few persons. Gr. *oligos* few, and *arche* rule.

Leon was one of the ten generals referred to above. *Salaminian*, because he belonged to Salamis.

Put to death—Pronounce the sentence of death on.

Frequently—Every now and then, L. *frequens*, *frequentis*, common, usual, full, crowded ; same root as *farcio* to cram.

Implicate—Involve ; connect. L. *im* for *in*, *plicare* to fold.

Care a straw for death—Care even as much as a straw. Notice *straw* is to be taken as adverbial accusative here. Similar expressions are, *care a fig*, *care a jot*, *care a button*.

[PAGE 63.]

That Government—The oligarchy.

Terrify—Notice *fy* is a disguised form of L. *facio* to make. It is so in all the words ending in *fy*.

N. B.—The Oligarchy that succeeded Democracy in Athens was called the Reign of Terror, the thirty who were at the head of the Government being Thirty Tyrants. It was in the year 404 that Socrates was ordered to go to Salamis and bring over Leon. Socrates became exceptionally obnoxious to the Thirty and they threatened him with punishment under a special ordinance forbidding "the teaching of the art of argument."

Brought across : Because he had to be brought over the sea, Salamis being a city on the east coast of Cyprus.

XXI. SOCRATES NEVER YIELDED A POINT IN A QUESTION OF RIGHT OR WRONG.

This section opens by a generalization of the topic in the last one. This is an instance, Socrates intends to say, of the fact that a man, whoever he is, cannot be a public servant, and maintain strict justice and honesty at the same time, without bringing ruin upon himself.

Yielded a single point, etc.—Gave up a single question in favour of an adversary whoever he was.

Withheld—Become difficult of access ; become unserviceable. The reasons are given thus :

(1) I do not charge anything for my conversation ; and

(2) I do not refuse to converse with anybody.

[PAGE 64.]

And if any man, etc : He intends to say that no one can accuse him of partiality or favour to any particular person.

XXII. HE PROPOSES THAT MELETUS SHOULD CALL SOME WITNESSES.

Why—Why it is ; that is, reason. Cf. section xth what follows.

In every way, etc.—In all possible ways in which divine will can be revealed to man.

Refuted—Disproved; proved to be false. L. *Re* back, *futo*, from the root of *fundo* to pour.

Crito is a friend of Socrates. More about him can be learnt from 'Crito' and 'Phædo.'

Deme—A territorial sub-division of Attica.

Of my own age: This shows Crito was about the same age as Socrates.

N. B.—Some of the names that follow are not very notable with the exception of the fact that they were all citizens.

[PAGE 65.]

N. B.—Notice he first mentions some who are fathers, next, some who are brothers, of those young men that spent their time in his company.

Called as witnesses—Called to give evidence against me in this case.

Stand aside—Remain aside, that is, in order to enable him to do his business.

As Meletus, etc: Notice the use of *as* here. It is a relative pronoun.

Some reason for, etc.—Some reason as, perhaps, a liking for me and ignorance of the fact that they are being corrupted.

Grown up—Advanced in years and not at all young and inconsiderate. ✓

XXIII. SPEAKS DISPARAGINGLY OF THE PRACTICE OF EXCITING MERCY OF THE COURT.

Pretty much—Considerably much. Notice *pretty* is an adverb here.

[PAGE 66.]

Acquit—Discharge. L. *ac* (for *ad*-) to, *quietare*, a verb formed from *quietus* discharged, free; the root is the same as in *quiet*.

To your feelings—To your feelings of mercy and compunction.

None—An indefinite numeral (negative).

The supreme danger—The highest danger of being condemned to death.

Perhaps he: *He* here refers to some one among you.

Harden himself—Petrifies himself or becomes incapable of showing mercy, or enables himself to be harsh against me.

Notices this: *This* here refers to his not bringing his wife and children and relations and friends before the court so that they may excite the gentle feelings of the listeners and pray to acquit him.

It may make him angry, because he may be disposed to think that I am too haughty to bring some here to pray to the assembly for mercy.

Kinsmen—Relatives by blood.

Homer was the great epic poet of Greece. Much of any historic value is not known about him, and many of the works once attributed to him are lost, the only ones which remain are the *Illiad*, the *Odyssey*, Thirty-three Hymns, a mock-epic (the Battle of the Frogs and Mice), and some pieces of a few lines each. His works have been translated into English by various authors.

Stocks and stones: *Stocks* may be taken here to mean lifeless beings. There is another use of *stocks* (pl.) nowadays in the sense of red and gray bricks used for the exterior of the walls and the front of buildings.

Three sons—Lamprocles, Sophroniscus, and Menexenus. "Aristotle says that he had two wives. The first was Xanthippe, by whom he had a son named Lamprocles; the second was Myrto, the daughter of Aristides the Just; and he took her without any dowry, and by her he had two sons, Sophroniscus and Menexenus. But some say that Myrto was his first

wife. And some, among whom are Sotyrus and Hieronymus of Rhodes, say that he had them both at the same time. For they say that the Athenians on account of scarcity of men, passed a vote, with a view of increasing the population, that a man may marry one citizen, and might also have children by another who should be legitimate ; on which Socrates did so."—YONGE.

Lad—Boy.

Bring forward—Produce ; make (them) appear.

Arrogance—Haughtiness,

Cheap—Not worth much ; low in estimate.

Whether or no—Whether or not. The original sentence is equivalent to, in meaning, ' whether I can face death bravely or I cannot do it'. But the sentence as it stands is equivalent to ' whether I can face death bravely or no', *no* meaning, that being not the case.

Credit—Good repute.

At my age—At this old age of mine.

With my name—*Name* here means reputation.

Made up their mind—This is rather a curious use of the phrase. It means concluded.

[PAGE 67.]

Strange way—A manner both peculiar and unsuited to their condition.

At their trial—When they are being tried.

A terrible fate—A fearful misfortune. Notice *fate* has always a bad significance.

To be killed—To be put to death. That was the punishment itself. Death sentence was executed in Athens not by hanging but by making the condemned drink poison.

To live for ever—That they would be immortal.

If you did not, etc.—But for the sentence of death you would pass on them.

Bring discredit on—Cause (it) to suffer in estimation of others ; win disrepute for.

Would suppose—Would consider ; would regard.

Who are selected by, etc.—Because that was a democracy when the sovereign authority was reserved by people themselves, and the administration was carried on by their representatives.

For other honours—(Selected) to receive other honours.

Women—Because of their unmanly behaviour, (e. g. to weep to appeal to the mercy and not to the sense of justice of the people, etc.)

Those of you, etc.—He also advises Athenians of reputation not to have recourse to such unworthy methods.

You ought not to allow us—Nor should you allow men like myself to have recourse to such things.

Notice *ought* is the principal verb here in both the cases. It was originally a preterite of the verb *to owe*. *Ought* is nowadays chiefly used as an auxiliary verb expressing fitness, expediency, propriety, moral obligation or the like, in the action or state indicated by the principal verb. It is slightly stronger than *should*.

Show—Make it plain by your actions.

Ridiculous—Exposed to mockery and laughter.

Acting, as on a stage.

XXIV. THAT IS NOT RIGHTEOUS EITHER.

Question—Consideration ; point of view.

Condemnation—Sentence of punishment, particularly of death, here.

That way—In that manner of exciting their mercy, by weeping and wailing, etc.

Convince—Make yield to truth. L. *con, vincere* to conquer.

Give away—To hand over ; to deliver.

Judgment—Continually balanced opinion.

Forswear—To act in violation of an oath. *For-* here means against.

Righteously—Free from wrong or sin. O. E. *right-* wise, meaning in the direction of. Hence the word means in the direction of right. Cf. *lengthwise, breadth-* wise, etc.

Note his reasons are three :—

- (1) It is not right ;
- (2) it is not just ; and
- (3) it is not holy.

[PAGE 68.]

Impiety. One of the charges being that he does not believe in the gods accepted by Athens. L. *im* not, *pietas* devoutness. Notice piety and pity are doublets.

Notice he intends to say that he should not use any unrighteous method to free himself from a charge of impiety.

Prevail over—Influence ; persuade successfully. L. *Pre* before, and *valere* to come.

N. B.—The idea is, to do an unholy act is as good as not believing in the gods.

In the gods as : Notice *as* qualifies so understood. The sentence when full would be, 'I do believe in the gods so (*i. e.*, to that extent,) as no one, etc.'

Cause—Case.

Decided—concluded ; determined on the merits.

N. B.—This finishes the defence. Then when asked to vote 281 are against him and 220 in his favour. See

foot-note on p. 68, text-book. A *dicast* in ancient Greece was a functionary answering a modern juryman.

XXV. IN SPITE OF THE VERDICT HE HOLDS THAT
HE IS A PUBLIC BENEFACTOR.

Verdict—An answer of the jury given to the court concerning any matter of fact in any case (civil or criminal) committed to their examination and determination. L. *vere* truly, *dictum* a saying.

Changed sides—Had taken the opposite side, that is, held a contrary view.

So I think, etc. : If the first *so* is regarded as equivalent to *therefore*, then *as* qualifies another *so* understood. Or if the order of words would be 'I think I have escaped Meletus *so*,' then *as* qualifies that *so* itself.

Come forward—Appeared before the court to work with Meletus in securing votes against me. The idea is three men together has secured 281 votes against me, and if it was the work of Meletus himself then he would not have secured a fifth part of the votes of the dicasts.

Drachmæ : A drachma is equivalent to a French franc, though it may be slightly in excess. According to some 25²² francs = £1, and thus 1000 drachmæ = £39 13s 2^{6d}. nearly,

[PAGE 69.]

Proposes—Suggests.

Penalty—Punishment. L. *pæna* punishment. *Pain* is from the same root.

Counter-penalty—Alternative penalty. *Counter* here means contrary to.

Military commands—Offices of the commanders in the military service. Between the years 432 and 422 B. C. he had served very bravely as hoplite in three different campaigns, and if he had continued

that very way, there is no doubt that he would have risen to the rank of military commanders.

Popular oratory—Speech-making with regard to public affairs. Oratory and rhetoric, "the art of words", were becoming very popular in those days.

Political appointments—Appointments in the service of the state, of embassy, etc.

Clubs—Associations of men for the promotion of common objects, such as science, politics, literature, fellowship, etc.

Factions—Political parties. Notice at the time of Socrates' life, there existed one after the other democracy, oligarchy, etc., in Athens, and it was possible for him to have supported any party.

Conscientious—Acting according to one's own conscience.

To preserve my life—He intends to say that on account of his rigid principles of integrity he would have brought about his being punished with death at any time.

Engaged—Became bound ; started. Notice it is intransitive here. *L. en*, and *gager* from *gage* a pledge.

The greatest of service—He calls it greatest, because perfection of soul is the greatest that one should attend to.

Had thought of Athens—What he intends to say is that one should exactly determine the conditions and requirements of Athens before meddling with her affairs.

Bestow his thoughts—Consider within himself ; reflect in his own mind.

Really to propose—To propose as a matter of true fact ; actually free to propose.

Suitable to me—Fit for me.

Poor benefactor—A benefactor whose means are very meagre; a benefactor without any wealth of his own. Notice the derivation. *L. bene* food, *fac*, from the root *facio* to make, and *tor* a suffix indicating agent. Cf. Skt. *tru*.

Leisure—Spare time. Originally it was a verb in the infinitive mood meaning to be permitted. *L. licere* to be permitted. SKEAT remarks that "the form is bad; it should be *leiser* or *leisir*; pleasure is in the same case. The suffix has been changed from *er* or *ir* to *ure* (as in measure)."

Public maintenance—Maintenance or providing with the necessities at the cost of public funds or state money.

Prytaneum—(Gr. root *pro* first or chief.) "In general in Ancient Greece, each state, city, or village possessed its own central hearth and sacred fire, representing the unity and vitality of the community. The fire was kept alight continuously, tended by the king or members of his family. The building in which the fire was kept was the Prytaneum, and the chieftain (the king or prytanis) probably made it his residence. Prytaneum was regarded as religious and political centre of the community and was the nucleus of all government, and the official "home" of the whole people.....and fore.g. ambassadors and citizens who had deserved especially well of the state were entertained in the Prytaneum as public guests."

[PAGE 70.]

Olympic games—(or Olympics) were the greatest national festivals of the ancient Greeks, consisting of athletic games and races, dedicated to Olympian Zeus celebrated once in four years at Olympia, and continuing five days. The victor was given but a wreath of wild olives, and nevertheless, the distinction was considered to be a very high one.

N. B. 1.—These were really great religious festivals at which the Hellenes met in a common worship and to share in a common amusement.

N. B. 2.—The period of four years between two successive celebrations of the Olympic games was called an *Olympiad*. The first Olympiad began at midsummer 776 B. C., the second Olympiad at midsummer 772 B. C., and soon. From the time of the first Olympiad, the chronology of Grecian history became consecutive, any event being dated by the statement that it occurred in a particular year of a specified Olympiad.

Horse or chariots: Thiss hows that there were also horse and chariot races.

Seem happy—Appear happy. For, the momentary pleasure he contributes towards your happiness is not real.

Really happy—Happy in the true sense of the word. For, he would help one towards the perfection of his own soul. ✓

XXVII. EXILE, FINE, OR IMPRISONMENT NOT SUITED TO HIM.

Stubborn—Unreasonably perverse or obstinate. From A. S. *stȳble* a stub. Thus *stubborn* stock-like, not easily moved, like an old stub or stump.

A little time—For a short time. Notice it is an adverbial accusative. Cf. p. 38.

Elsewhere—In other states.

A trial of life and death—A trial involving the life or death of a person.

Gross—Shameful ; flagrant.

Wrong myself—Do injustice to myself. He intends to say—

(1) I have done no wrong to another :

(2) Why then should I propose a penalty that does me evil ?

Slave of successive officials : Because a prisoner has to obey implicitly the order of every official.

[PAGE 76.]

I should have to etc. : Inasmuch as I have no money to pay the fine with.

Dear—Precious.

Cheerfully—Without a murmur or dissenting voice.

Tolerate—Endure L. *tolero*, *toleratum*, to bear or support, from root seen *tollo* to lift up.

Discussion—Discourses. L. *dis* apart, *quatero* to shake.

Burdensome—Grievous to be borne ; causing pain in enduring. Notice the suffix *some*, which means full of. Cf. *troublesome*, *frolicsome*, *wearisome*, etc.

Odious—Offensive ; hateful. L. *odi* I hate.

Seeking—Attempting ; trying.

Likely—Probable. *Like* is the adjective and *ly* (an adverbial suffix derived from *like* itself).

Continually—Every now and then.

Expelled—Drove away. L. *ex* out, *pello* to drive.

Drive away—Expel. He intends to say,

- (1) Wherever I go, young men will follow me ;
- (2) if I drive them away, they will persuade their elders to expel me ; and
- (3) if I do not drive them away, their elders will expel me for their sake.

XXVIII. PROPOSES A FINE OF 30 MINÆ.

Hold your peace—Not to give expression to your thoughts ; pass your time without meddling with others.

In earnest—Grave ; serious.

[PAGE 72.]

Unexamined life—A mode of life, the nature of which is not well inquired into and understood.

Accustomed—Used ; *L. ac* for *ad*, *constitue* custom.

Deserve—Merit. *L. de* (intensitive suffix), *servio* to serve.

Smp **Plato**, so called because of his broad shoulders,—his real name was Aristocles, was born at Athens about 429 B. C. His father was Ariston and his mother Perioctione. Born of aristocratic parents, he hated the democracy of Athens. Previously to his acquaintance with Socrates when he was about twenty years old, he had received instruction in philosophy from Kratylos the Heraclitian, and probably from Epicharmes the Pythagorean. He also seems to have been conversant with the philosophy of the Ionian school, as well as that of Anaxagoras. "Of his long and close intimacy with Socrates in the course of which his own system gradually took shape, it is only necessary to make mention."

After the execution of his master, he repaired to Megara, remaining sometime in companionship with Euclid, doubtless devoting himself with ardour to the Eleatic philosophy, of which Euclid was the great post-Socratic exponent. He subsequently entered upon a prolonged period of travel, visiting first Ionia, and then Cyrene and Egypt, and occupying himself with mathematical and other studies. Of more influence on his subsequent intellectual development was his journey to Italy, where he became more intimately acquainted with the Pythagorean system and more thoroughly assimilated its doctrines, than previously. Possibly this influence induced him to intermeddle with the political affairs of Syracuse. It was on his way home thence to Athens, that he was (under circumstances variously related) captured and sold into slavery ; a state in which he might have remained but for the interposition of his

friend, Anniceris the Cyrenaic, who ransomed him. On his arrival at Athens, about forty years of age, he founded his school in the groves of Academos, subsequently purchasing the garden on the hill Kolonos, and its perpetual possession. With the exception of two further fruitless expeditions to Sicily, he remained in Athens devoting himself to teaching and writing for the remainder of his life, which terminated in B. C. 339."—BAX.

Sureties—Securities.

N. B.—At this stage Socrates is condemned to death. Critics, however, are not wanting with regard to his behaviour and here is one opinion: "When he was found guilty, it now rested with the accused to make a counter-proposition, and there can be little doubt that had Socrates without further remark suggested some smaller but yet substantial penalty, the proposal would have been accepted. But to the amazement of the judges and to the distress of his friends, Socrates proudly declared that for the services which he had rendered to the city he deserved not punishment, but the reward of a public benefactor—maintenance in the Prytaneum at the cost of the state."

XXIX. HE SAYS THAT DEATH IS PERHAPS THE BEST THAT CAN COME TO HIM.

Very much of him : What he means to say is that as his life must soon come naturally to a close, they have not cut him off of a good portion of his life.

Evil name—A tainted reputation.

Revile—Speak ill of. *Re* again, *vil* cheap.

Cast in your teeth—Utter reproaches. Sometimes there is *into* in place of *in*. Cf.

"All his faults observed.
Set in a note-book, learned and conned by rote.
'To cast into my teeth.'

—*Julius Caesar*, iv. iii.

For a little while—For a short time to come.

Constantly—Always ; in an unbroken manner. *L. con*, and *sto* to stand.

All through—Completely through.

Withstand—Resist ; check, *With* here is in the sense of against.

Come upon—Met : happened to.

[PAGE 76.]

Farewell—Prosper ; to get on.

XXXII. OBSERVATION ON DEATH.

N. B.—Notice the two notions of death that were prevalent in Athens in the days of Socrates :

(1) A complete cessation of all the functions of the body ; and

(2) a migration of the soul to another world.

Socrates holds that in either case he is benefitted.

Ceases—Stops.

Migration—Passage ; removing from one place of residence to another. Notice the passage of soul from one place to another is called transmigration. *L. migro* to migrate, a root found also in *emigrate*, *immigrate*.

Slumbers—Sleeps, *M. E. slumeren* a frequentative of *slumen*. The *b* is excrescent.

Unbroken—Undisturbed.

Great king—The king of Persia, the Persian empire being the largest that was known to them in those days.

Nay : A negative which is used to correct one's self.

Count it—Regard it.

Eternity—That which lasts for ever. Duration without beginning or end. *L. æternus*, *æviternus*, from *ævum* age, and the adjective suffix *turnus*.

Single night, because it is long, unbroken dream.

[PAGE 77.]

Self-styled—Calling one's self so.

Minos, a king and lawgiver of Crete, made at death supreme judge of the lower world, before whom all the dead appeared to give an account of their stewardship, and to receive the reward of their deeds.

Rhadamanthus, son of Jupiter and Europa. He reigned in the Cyclades with such impartiality that at death he was made one of the judges of the infernal region.

Æacus, king of *Ænopia*, a man of such integrity and piety, that he was made at death one of the judges of the hell.

N. B.—All these three are said to sit 'in judgment below,' that is, in the lower world or hell. The point to be noted is that they are the real judges so made by God, while those here, who call themselves so, are not at all so strictly speaking.

Demi-gods—Half gods, that is to say, in whom humanity and divinity can both be traced.

N. B.—Now he gives the names of some poets and bards.

Orpheus: A Thracian musician whose lyre could charm beasts and make trees and rocks move. When his wife Eurydice died he descended to Hades, and so pleased Pluto by his music that he allowed him to lead her back to earth, but warned him not to look behind him till he reached the upper world. This warning he neglected, and Eurydice, who was following him, vanished again among the shades. The obstinate grief of Orpheus for her loss so angered the Thracian Bacchantes that they tore him limb from limb and threw him into the river Hebrus.

Musæus—the poet (B. C. 1410), author of the elegant tale of Leander and Hero. Virgil places him in the Elysian fields, 'attended by a vast multitude of

ghosts, Musæus being a taller by a head than any of them (*Æneid*, vi, 677).

Hesiod, a Greek poet, about 776 B. C.

Homer : See XXIII, above.

N. B.—He next cites the instance of some who died of unjust punishment like himself.

Palamedes, the son of Nauplios, who invented measures, scales, dice, etc. He also detected that the madness of Ulysses was only assumed.

Ajax, son of Telamon, is also styled *the Greater*. He was the king of Salamis, a man of giant nature, daring, and self-confident. When the armour of Hector was awarded to Ulysses instead of to himself, he turned mad from vexation and stabbed himself.

Odysseus (same as Ulysses), king of Ithaca, a small rocky island of Greece. He is represented in Homer's *Iliad* as full of artifices, and according to Virgil, hit upon the device of the wooden horse, by which Troy was ultimately taken. (The word means the angry and wrathful). After the fall of Troy, Ulysses was driven about by tempests for ten years before he reached home, and his adventures form the subject of Homer's other epic called the *Odyssey*.

Sisyphus—A fraudulent avaricious king of Corinth, whose task in the world of shades, is to roll a huge stone to the top of a hill, and fix it there. It so falls out that the stone no sooner reaches the hill tops than it bounds down again.

XXXIII. HIS WORDS TO HIS ATHENIAN FRIENDS BEFORE GOING TO PRISON.

Good courage—Unfailing boldness.

[PAGE 72.]

By chance—By accident.

Sign—The divine indication. He intends to say that the divine indication that was ever guiding him in all his movements did not in the least check him that day either when he left his house to appear before the court or at the time when he was making the apology. So he thinks that the sentence of death that was passed on him was for his own good, or, as he thinks, the divine voice would have told him to the contrary.

Visit them with punishments—Inflict punishment upon them.

Before—In preference to.

One would expect that his last request would be that they should be kind to his sons whom he was soon leaving helpless in the world. But his notions of virtue to the exclusion of everything else make him make a request that they must see his sons always virtuous, and even punish them if they would swerve from a righteous path.

CRITO.

(i) On the morning of the day (just two days before the death of Socrates), Crito goes to the prison where Socrates was and is struck at the sound sleep of Socrates though very soon he was to die. The Athenians are waiting for the return of a ship they had sent—according to their annual custom—to Apollo at Delos, for which the mission was away, and no one could be put to death in the interim. Crito expects that the ship will arrive that day and is sorry that Socrates will have to die the next day. (ii) But Socrates has just dreamt a dream, wherein a vision says to Socrates that he will die on the third day from that, and feels confident that the ship will not arrive that day but on the day following. (iii) Crito tries to persuade Socrates to escape from prison and promises to place his fortune at his disposal. Finding Socrates not accepting the proposal he goes on to persuade him more. (iv) He asks Socrates not to entertain any fear regard-

ing the safety of his (Crito's) own self or the expense that it might involve. He adds that Socrates need not consider that exile will not suit him either, for there were several places where he would be welcome. (v) He says Socrates would be doing wrong if he would lose the chance of saving his own life. That would simply be the game of his enemies, and besides his children would be neglected and left to endure the fate of the orphans. Crito adds that the whole thing that has happened to Socrates is on account of the cowardice of himself and his friends. They did not save him nor did he save himself. There was no time left to consider, but a resolve should be taken at once, lest if that night be past everything would be disaster. (vi) But Socrates says that Crito's anxiety to save him would have been valuable if that were right. And Socrates would never listen to any one but the voice of reasoning though multitude should scare them with fresh terrors. Whatever he used to say he would still adhere to, and one should esteem the good opinion of the wise and not worthless ones. (vii) In the question of right or wrong and of the base and the honourable, and of good and evil, the opinion of one good man is to be followed and not that of multitude. For if there is a perfect man like that, in his presence we feel more shame and fear than before all men. (viii) We must not think so much of what the many will say of us ; we must think of what the one man, who understands right and wrong, and of what Truth herself will say of us. (ix) The consideration of expense, reputation, and of bringing up my children are to be the reflections of our friends. But reason should be our guide and that shows us whether a thing we do is right or wrong ? If we find that it is wrong to do a thing we must not on any account, either of death or other evil, take to that. Of course Socrates asks Crito to convince him if he has anything to say to the contrary. (x) It is not that we may do wrong in some cases and not in other ones. We must do no wrong at all intentionally, for wrong

Alternative—Choice ; L. *alterno* to do things by turns.

The chief points in the section are :

(1) The laws are published ; one can understand them when he grows to be a man ; and he must then decide whether he can abide by them or not.

(2) If he stays there, he is said to have consented to abide by the laws ; and if he does not like them, he is at liberty to go and live where he likes.

XIV. SOCRATES MUST NOT ESCAPE.

Expose—Make yourself liable. L. *ex* out, *poser* to place, to lay.

That not less, etc. *That* means exposing himself to the said charges. He would be more liable to the accusation than any other Athenian. The reason as will be pointed out is that Socrates had seldom been elsewhere.

Retort—To return the censure. L. *re* back, *torquere* to twist.

With justice—Justly ; rightly.

Festivals—Occasions of joy and mirth, generally of a religious kind. There were several such held in Greece.

Isthmian games were so called because they were held on the Isthmus of Corinth. They consisted of chariot races, running, wrestling, boxing etc. They were held every alternate spring, the first and third of each Olympiad.

Contented—Were satisfied with. L. *contentus* content.

[PAGE 98.]

Offered—Proposed as an alternative punishment.

If he had proposed a less form of punishment at the time of his trial, the state would have allowed him

that. He says that having missed that opportunity when he could have left Athens lawfully, he should not now escape from the prison.

Gloried—Took a pride ; considered it an honourable thing.

Without it—Without the consent of Athens (especially as it has pronounced the sentence of death on you).

Ashamed—Feel the sense of shame for doing a wrong act. Notice the prefix *a* is intensitive and gives the meaning of *of*.

Miserable—Wretched ; having a mean mode of life.

Covenant—Stipulation ; compact. L. *con, venir* to agree. Though *covenant* and *agreement* both denote a contract between two parties, yet *covenant* is often found used in a religious sense ; *e. g.* the solemn league and *covenant*. Thus covenants and agreements may be taken to signify, your contract which was both religious and legal in character.

Not in mere words, etc. : The idea is, your stipulation was not one of words which was yet to be satisfied, but you have actually shown yourself by your acts that you have consented to abide by the laws of Athens.

Make them—Make those covenants and agreements.

Force—Coercion. Strength or undue power exercised upon another contrary to law.

Fraud—Deceit ; deception deliberately practised upon another. An intentional perversion of truth for the purpose of obtaining some valuable thing or promise from another.

Lacedæmon—Was a state south of Laconia, a part of Greece. Sparta was its capital.

Crete—One of the Ionian islands. It was noted for its skill in archery.

Hellenes—Greeks. The Greek writers and people called their land *Hellas*, the term meaning, however, all territory in which their own people, whom they called *Hellenes* were settled. *Hellas* was originally the name of a district in Thessaly, in northern Greece, the people of which gradually spread over the neighbouring territory, and the name was in time adopted by the other tribes. *Greece* is the name given to it by the Romans, though wrongly.

[PAGE 99.]

Barbarians—Foreigners. Notice the word does not mean uncivilized men here. The word "is certainly not derived from the Latin *barba* (a beard), as many suppose, because it is a Greek word and has many analogous ones. The Greeks and the Romans called all the foreigners *barbarians* (babblers; men who spoke a language not understood by them); the Jews called them *Gentiles* (other nations); the Romans *Ostiaks* (foreigners)." *Welsh* is a similar term. "The reproachful meaning crept in from the natural egotism of man. It is not very long ago that an Englishman looked with disdainful pity on a foreigner, and the French still retain much of the same national exclusiveness."

You went away from Athens, etc.: The idea is that even the lame, the blind, and the cripple have more gone abroad than you have ever done. That is to say, Socrates had seldom travelled abroad and almost invariably stayed in Athens.

The chief point to be noted is that one's staying in a state amounts to a religious and legal contract of his obeying the laws of the state, and he must not break it on any account. ✓

XV. SOCRATES' DEATH WOULD BE A BETTER THING THAN HIS ESCAPE.

Transgressing—Violating; going against. *L. trans*—beyond, *gradi* to stop, to go; that is, to go beyond what is established.

Tolerably—Pretty well.

Civil rights—Rights of a citizen, such as the protection of laws, etc.

Forfeiting—Losing the right to it on account of their misdeeds; being deprived of. *L. foris* out of doors, *facere* to do.

If found out, he intends to say that his friends will have to suffer in person and property. They have to lose all they possess and spend the rest of their lives in miserable exile.

Thebes was a city in Bæotia. It was being well governed then, for, 28 years to come (371 B. C.), it was to be supreme in Greece.

Come as an enemy—Arrive in those states as an enemy, not as a welcome friend.

Look askance—Look with an amount of suspicion; *askance* sideways.

Subverter—One who upsets. *L. sub* under, *verto* to turn.

N. B.—The idea running here is this. If you escape from the prison, people will suspect that you are capable of misdeeds. That makes them think that you must really be a corruptor of the young and thoughtless. That makes them believe that you are an enemy of their commonwealth. To escape that, you must go to a place where the administration is not good. In that case life is not worth living.

Thoughtless—Those whose who have no discretionary powers.

Consort—Associate; keep company with *L. con,* *sors* a lot.

[PAGE 100.]

Disorder—Confused state of things with regard to society and state.

Licence—Liberty enjoined especially in a wrong

direction ; freedom abused in contempt of law and decorum. L. *licere* to be allowable.

Ludicrous—Very ridiculous. L. *ludus* sport or game.

Put on—Wear.

Altered—Changed to conceal the identity.

Clung to—Stuck to with firmness.

Blush—To change colour out of roused mental conditions.

Cf. The last part of Sec. iv. (Crito) where Crito says, that he has got friends in Thessaly who will shelter Socrates "from any annoyance from the people" (p. 85, text book.) This descriptions of the Thessalians by Socrates shows what the annoyance might be. To escape it, Socrates should displease no one, and if he does displease, they will say so many things that make him blush.

Flatterer, because to please the Thessalians.

Slave of all men, because he has to give up his judgment, and go on pleasing anyone and everyone he meets. Notice, Socrates has said in the court "why should I pass the rest of my days in prison, the slave of successive officials?" (p. 70, text book).

Feasting—Eating well, etc., a life so very detestable to a philosopher.

N. B.—With regard to the education of his children what he says is this: If I take them with me, it is worse for them. If I leave them in Athens and go away alone, my friends will not take care of them. And if I die, there is a chance of my friends taking care of them.

[PAGE 101.]

Make a journey—Travel.

Hades (2 syllables). The places of the departed spirits. It may be either Paradise or "Tartarus". See

**XVI. WRONG DOING BRINGS MISERY BOTH ON EARTH
AND AFTER DEATH.**

Advised—Take our advice.

Before justice—In preference to justice.

The rulers, etc.—The three judges are Rhadamanthos, Minos, and Æcos. (See p. 77, text book.)

Not by us the laws, etc.—He intends to say that the laws of Athens are in no way bad, but the men have so conspired that injustice should be done to him.

We shall be angry, etc.—That is to say, he cannot find happiness while living, nor after death.

Our brethren :—Notice how this gives a sort of sacred characteristic to the laws on earth. Cf. 'more sacred, and holier,' (p. 95, text book).

— **Kindly—**In a kind or gracious manner. That is, the laws of the other world will not be in any way favourable to him either.

N. B.—The idea running in the sections xiv—xvi are :

(1) It is on account of neither force nor fraud, but I voluntarily submitted myself to the laws of Athens in preference to the laws of either any other part of Greece, or of foreign nations. It is now ridiculous that I should break them.

(2) If I go to well-governed states, people will look upon me with suspicion and regard me as an enemy of their commonwealth ; and if I go to the states not well-governed, then life is not worth living at all.

(3) If I go to Thessaly, then I have to flatter and please every one in my own interests, and that life which amounts to slavery I cannot appreciate.

(4) If I break the laws on earth, then I can be happy neither here nor in the world to come.

XVII. SOCRATES' CONCLUDING REMARKS TO CRITO.

Cybele (also called Rhea) was the daughter of Uranus, and mother of Zeus, Hera, Poseidon, Hestia, etc. She was also called the *Mother of the gods*, and *Cybele* was the name given to her by the Phrygians. It is under the name of *Cybele* that her worship was introduced into Rome, (*Rhea* being her Greek name).

Cybele was known as the "All-begetter, All-nourisher, and the Mother of all the blest. She was the great, fruitful, kindly earth itself. Especial emphasis was placed upon her maternity over wild-nature. She was called the Mountain-mother; her sanctuaries were almost invariably upon mountains, and frequently in caves, the name *Cybele* itself being derived from the latter; lions were her faithful companions. . . . She was also a chaste and beautiful deity. Her especial affinity with wild nature was manifested by the orgiastic character of her worship. (Her attendants, the Corybantes were wild half demonic beings. Her priests, the Galli, were eunuchs attired in female garb with long hair fragrant with ointment. Together with priestesses they celebrated her rites with flutes, horns, castanets, cymbals, and tambourines, madly yelling and dancing until their frenzied excitement found its culmination in self-scourging, self-laceration, or exhaustion. Self-emasculation sometimes accompanied with delirium of worship on the part of the candidates for the priesthood."

Frenzy—A condition of temporary madness.

N. B.—The above explains why they used to get into a frenzied condition.

Rings loudly etc.: "He feels as it were that the laws and the administration of the state speak in this manner to him.

Drowns: That voice is so powerful that it makes it impossible for any other voice to reach his ear. He means to say that the voice he hears is so powerful that no persuasion to the contrary can even fall on his ears.

That is to say, he is determined to act rightly, and cannot change his mind and act otherwise.

[PAGE 102.]

" To change my mind—To alter my determination ;
To make me think in any other way.

In vain—Without any effect ; uselessly.

Anyhow, Socrates gives him a chance that if he thinks that he can persuade him still, he is at liberty to speak further.

Say on—Speak further. ✓

PHÆDO.

(LVIII—LXVI.)

The *Phædo* is the story of the death of Socrates related by Phædo to Echecrates. Both were pupils and friends of Socrates. It is only as a mark of respect to Phædo that Plato designates this dialogue by his name. It begins with an explanation of Socrates' having to stay long in prison, gives an account of the last conversation he had with his friends, and ends with the closing scene of his life.

In the *Phædo*, Plato undertakes to substantiate the belief of immortality and pre-existence of the soul and "base it anew by narrating the last hours of Socrates, who is represented as calmly discussing the question with his friends when his own death was immediately at hand."

Much information can be gathered by a careful reading of the *Phædo*, and the dialogue should be read in full to be appreciated. The idea running through the *Phædo* may broadly be classed under three heads : (1) the question of birth and death ; (2) the nature of the soul ; and (3) the various regions of the earth through which soul has to pass. It is the third fact that is described in the sections lviii—lxvi, and for

the sake of information some of the chief points discussed in (1) and (2) may be stated as follows :—

i. Death is merely a separation of the soul from the body.

ii. The soul leaves the body, wanders for some time and is born again.

iii. Nothing can arise from nothing. And if the dead are not born again, but only the living go on dying, then the world should come to nothing very soon.

iv. Knowledge comes from recollection.

v. If the soul is pure, it departs to the invisible world, and if tainted by communion with the body, she lingers hovering near the earth, and is born as some lower animal.

vi. Soul is prior to the body.

vii. All soul is equally soul.

viii. The soul is not dependent upon the bodily elements but has the power of controlling them, etc. etc.

SUMMARY (lviii). The earth is a spherical body placed at the centre of the celestial globe. It needs no other force to keep it in its place, and the uniformity of the heavens and the equipoise of the earth itself are quite sufficient. The earth itself is pure and placed in the centre of the pure celestial sphere, and what we call water, air, etc., are all certain sediments that sink to the bottom. To see the real splendour of the heavens, and thus realize the purity of the earth itself, we have to go to the top of the atmospheric region. Things here in our world have been corroded and spoilt even as things in the sea by brine. Things in the other world far excel the corresponding things here on our world. (lix). The earth in that upper region looks like a ball coloured with various colours, each colour superior in the point of brightness to what our painters use. There are also hollows

there, but they are filled not with water but with air. The things on our earth are all corroded and spoiled by the air even as things are by brine at the bottom of the sea. Pebbles that can be picked up there are as good as our precious stones, and they along with gold and silver adorn that region. Men live there on the coasts of the air-seas, in the islands in the midst of them, and also towards the interior of the land. Their air corresponds to our water, and their ether to our air. Their seasons are subject to less extremes of heat and cold. As decay and disease are less there, men live longer than we do here. Gods live there in their real shapes and men can have direct intercourse with them. Their happiness, though like ours, differs in point of extent. (lx) There are all sorts of rivers inside the earth, the rivers of fire, rivers of liquid mud, rivers of lava, rivers of hot and cold water, etc. The streams take their course on earth and fall into the sea, whence into that infernal chasm called the Tartarus, which is the deepest of all the hollows. Air moves with water, and as there is always an oscillating motion irresistible blasts of wind are caused. There are underground channels, and it is they that feed the seas, the lakes, the rivers, and the springs. Some of these rivers traverse a portion of the earth, other ones take one complete round about the earth, and some still take more than one complete round. Then the deepest they can fall is the centre of the earth, and there they must flow uphill again. (lxi) There are various great rivers of which the most important are four. *First*, there is Oceanus, which takes a complete circle round the earth. *Secondly*, there is Acheron which flows in a direction opposite to the Oceanus. It flows through desert places, then takes a subterranean course, and then empties itself to the Acherusian lake. *Thirdly*, there is the Pyriphlegethon, a river of boiling liquid fire. Its course is short on earth, but it has several subterranean windings. What we call lava is part of that very river. That falls to the lower part of Tartarus. *Fourthly*, there is the Stygian

stream, flowing in a direction opposite to that of Phlegethon. It first falls into the Styx, and acquiring peculiar properties, takes several windings inside the earth, and then fall into the Acherusian lake. It is called Cocytus. Acherusian lake is the place where the spirits of the departed generally go. (lxii) There are four kinds of people that can be distinguished from one another according to the merits of their actions while on earth. *First*, there are those who led a life neither virtuous nor vicious. The souls of such go to the Acheron whence by taking vessels that wait for them there they go the Acherusian lake where they are rewarded or punished according as the extent of their good or bad actions. *Secondly*, there are those that have committed unpardonable sacrileges, there is no hope for them, and they are cast into the Tartarus to be tortured there for ever. *Thirdly*, there are those whose sins are pardonable. They have to stay in the Tartarus for one year, and then by being carried by the Cocytus or Pyriphlegethon as the case may be, they go to the Acherusian lake to call on, and implore the comradeship of those whom they had killed or outraged. Their sufferings cease if they prevail upon them, or they have to go back to come again in time to do the same, and until they prevail on those. *Fourthly*, there are those who have lived pure lives, and they are at once set free to live in purer regions without bodies. Noble is the prize and great is the hope, and one must leave nothing undone to obtain virtue and wisdom in this life. (lxiii) Socrates does not seem to have absolutely believed in this, for he says, that this, is after all, a fable and one should not insist on the exact nature of all this, though he must believe in some thing of the sort. The soul is shown to be immortal, and it is worth one's while to venture that way. He concludes that this is a thing that every man has to experience some day or the other, and as for his part his hour of leaving this world will come. He says that he must bathe before drinking poison so that he may not give the women the trouble

of washing his dead body. (lxiv). This discourse had, however, no effect on Crito, for hardly had Socrates stopped speaking when he asked him if he had any commands for him or for his friends about his children or about any other thing. The answer of the philosopher to that question was that they should take care of themselves, and if they would do so, then they will have served him and his and themselves in every way. Crito next asks him how his funeral should be conducted, but Socrates smiles at it and says that the real Socrates will soon have gone, and as to his body, they may bury it at their own pleasure. He asks his friends to assure Crito that the real Socrates will have gone to the other world, and make him feel his death less. Here he says that the wrong use of words is not only a fault in itself but is also an evil to the soul. (lxv). Socrates then went into another room to bathe himself. His friends waited his return feeling heavily all the while for what seemed a heavy loss to them. It seemed to them that they would lose a father and be left orphans for the rest of their life. And Socrates returned. Presently, the servant of the Eleven appeared before him and asked Socrates not to be unreasonable as others often were, and be angry with him and curse him if he is only doing his duty. He had, however, found Socrates the noblest and the gentlest all along, and feeling sorry that he had to administer the poison to such a man, he went away weeping. Socrates appreciated his kindness, and asked Crito to see that the poison was brought. Crito, however, asks him not to be in a hurry as there was plenty of time as yet, and proposes eating and drinking, and spending of a few more jolly hours. Socrates, however, says that he can gain nothing thereby, and, on the other hand, his own contempt for so greedily saving up his life would be roused. (lxvi). Crito had to obey and the poison was brought. He took the cup calmly, and the man who was to give him the poison, directed that he should drink it, walk up and down till his legs would feel heavy, and then lie down. To Socrates' question if he could make a libation out of it, the man

hinted that he should not, for, only as much poison as was necessary to put an end to one's life, they would prepare. Socrates understood him and drank the whole of it, then his friends could no longer check their grief and began to weep, Crito of course, had been unable to restrain his tears all the while, and Apollodorus burst into a loud cry and made every one of his friends there break down with his sobs. Socrates gives them a gentle admonition and told them that a man should die in silence. Then Socrates followed the directions that were given to him. He walked this way and that till his feet grew heavy, and lay down. The life was about to ebb out when he told Crito that he owed a cock to Asclepius and Crito should not fail to pay it. Crito said that would be done and asked if he wished anything more. Socrates made no answer and all was over. Crito closed his mouth and eyes. Thus ended the wisest, the justest and the best man that the age ever saw in Europe.

VIII. THE FORM OF THE EARTH AND REGIONS.

What do you mean? What is your idea? What it is it that you intend to convey? This is generally used when one cannot very well grasp what another is speaking to him about, or when he finds that the person before him is slightly ambiguous, and means that the matter should be more clearly put.

Simmias was a native of Thebes and a disciple of Philolaus. He was also a friend of Socrates.

Great deal—Pretty much.

The view—The opinion.

Convinced—Have a settled belief without any doubt.

The skill of Glaucus—The amount of skill that Glaucus possessed; the skill matching that possessed by Glaucus.

Glaucus was a sea divinity. He is also known as Pontius. Originally he was a fisherman and a diver in Anthendon in Bœotia. There are two accounts with regard to his becoming a divinity, (1) he ate a magical herb sown by Cronus, leapt into the sea, and there was changed into a god and endowed with the gift of unerring prophecy; and (2) he sprang into the sea for love of the sea god Melicertes, with whom he was often identified. He was worshipped not only at Anthendon, but on the coasts of Greece, Sicily, and Spain where fishermen and sailors at certain seasons watched for his arrival during the night in order to consult him. He is also said to have instructed Apollo in soothsaying. MILTON alludes to him in

"[By] old soothsaying Glaucus' spell"—*Comus*, line 895.

What, therefore, Socrates means is the extraordinary amount of skill Glaucus had to foretell everything in an unerring way.

Beyond—Past; beyond the extent of; above; surpassing that in degree. A. S. prefix *be*, and *geond* yond. What Socrates means is, that it is not difficult to describe it to another, though the extent of the skill Glaucus possessed becomes quite inadequate to give formal proofs. There are, of course, particular things that are to be believed in, and because of our arguing we must not lose our beliefs.

Come to an end—Have ceased to exist. The idea is that I will have been dead before I can be able to prove it to you, even if I knew how to do it.

[PAGE 198.]

Was finished—Would have been over.

Form of earth—The shape of the earth.

Regions—Divisions. L. *rego* to rule.

That will do—That is sufficient. That is to say, you need not prove to me all about it, and it is sufficient if you describe what the shape of the earth is and what its regions are.

Spherical body—Body which is of the shape of a sphere. A sphere is a solid body bounded on all sides by the circumference of a semi-circle revolving about its fixed diameter. Gr. *sphaira* a ball.

N. B.—The earth according to the notions of the modern western astronomy is not a complete sphere, but an oblate spheroid, that is, a sphere slightly flattened at its poles and more bulging at the equator. Its polar radius is thus slightly less than its equatorial one.

Placed at the centre of the heavens—Occupying the centre of the celestial sphere. The huge space on account of its infinite distance on all sides is regarded as a globe with infinite radius, and what he means to say is that the earth-globe is placed at the very centre of the celestial sphere. This was the geocentric theory which went on to be believed in the west, and in the eleventh century it was reduced to a system, known as Ptolemaic System, by Claudius Ptolemæus, a celebrated astronomer of Egypt. He taught that the earth is fixed in the centre of the universe, and the heavens revolve round it from east to west, carrying with them the sun, planets, and fixed stars in their respective spheres. He said that the moon was next above the earth, then Mercury, then Venus; the sun he placed between Venus and Mars, and after Mars, Jupiter and Saturn, beyond which came two crystalline spheres. Comparing this with what was preached by Anaxagoras (which see, above,) a vast advance seems to have gone on steadily in the science of astronomy till at last this theory was replaced by the Copernican system in the sixteenth century. Nicolas Copernicus was a Prussian astronomer, and his doctrine was that the earth moves round the sun, in opposition to what was up to then believed, from the time of Ptolemæus, that the sun moves round the earth. The present, however, is the notion that was in vogue at the time of Socrates.

Air—Atmosphere.

N. B.—It is hard to understand what this exactly means. There is one idea of the Indian astronomy that various planets are kept in their relative positions on account of one of the *Vayus* (*Vayu*, whatever it means as a technical term, is a synonym of the words signifying air, and thus interpreted as air by the common people), and are made to rotate about their own axes and also move in their orbits. Can it be that the early Greek notions and the notions that prevailed in India were of the same origin?

Force is that which compels rest or motion. It is thus explained: That which sets a body at rest in motion or brings a moving body to rest is called *force*.

Support it—Keep it in its place. *L. sup (sub) near, portare* to carry. *L. supportare* means to carry to a place; that is, to keep a body in its place. Cf. *to hold it up* below.

Equiformity—Uniformity.

Equipoise (*equi* and *poise*)—Equality of weight; equilibrium.

N. B.—The idea is the uniform nature of the celestial sphere, as well as the uniformity of weight of the earth on all sides, keeps it confined to the centre of the heavens. The forces now are so adjusting that everything is in a balanced condition, and, therefore, no particular force is necessary to compel the earth to rest in the centre of the heavens by counteracting any other force that may tend to disturb its rest.

Hold it up—Support it; keep it confined to its position in space.

A thing in equipoise—A thing in equilibrium; a thing the forces acting on which counteract each other and keep the body at rest.

In the centre etc.—In the exact middle place of a thing that is uniform.

N. B.—Notice, even the gravitation theory says that a body is attracted by the other, but the force with which each attracts the other is dependant upon the distance of the centres (or centres of gravity) of the bodies. Now a body is attracted by the earth, and if that is possible for the body to go on moving towards the centre of the earth, the force becomes less and less, till at last when it has reached the centre of the earth, whose centre coincides with the centre (or centre of gravity) of it, the body ceases to move any longer, and there is complete rest. Even so is the case of the earth (according to ideas of those days). There is the celestial region, and in the centre of it the earth is placed. Therefore the earth is at rest.

Unmoved—Without being disturbed by any force that tends to change its state

Perfect balance—Complete equilibrium.

Rightly—Exactly. Simmias means that he rightly believes in it.

He proceeded—He continued to speak; he went on.

I think—I hold; I believe; it is my view.

Vast extent—Great area. That is to say, the earth is not small in its area.

Who dwell—That inhabit; that live.

The Pillars of Hercules—The opposite rocks at the entrance of the Mediterranean Sea, one in Spain and the other on the African continent. The story is that they were once bound together till Hercules tore them asunder in order to get to Gades (Cadiz). The rocks were called Calpe and Abyla by the ancients, and now-a-days they are called Gibraltar Rock and Mount Hacho.

Inhabit—Occupy for the purposes of dwelling. *L.* in, *habitare* to dwell.

Marsh—A muddy wet region. The Mediterranean is compared to a marsh and men inhabiting its coast, to ants and frogs. This serves to show that the part of the earth known to them was limited, indeed, whereas the earth is a very vast one.

Elsewhere—In the other parts of the globe. The idea seems to be that to the ancients the world was limited indeed. The Roman Empire though consisted of the regions on the coast of the Mediterranean, Britain added of course, was called the empire of the world. A similar idea seems to have been held in early Greece, and Socrates intends to say that the world is certainly vaster than the regions round the Mediterranean.

Hollows—Depressed parts of the earth.

Every kind of shape and size—Of various kinds of shapes and size ; having different forms and bases.

Ether—A medium of great elasticity and extreme tenuity, supposed to pervade all space, the interior of solid bodies not excepted, and to be the medium of transmission of light and heat.

Sediment—Settlings ; the matter which subsides to the bottom from water or any other liquid.

N. B.—The idea is, ether is pure in itself and all the sediment of it, namely, the water, mist, and air, falls to the hollows of the earth and surrounds it on all sides.

[PAGE 199.]

Just like—Exactly like. *Just* is here an adverb qualifying *like*. For this use of *just*, compare,

"And having *just* enough, not covet more."—DRYDEN.

"To-night, at Herne's oak, *just* 'twixt twelve and one."—SHAKES.

Notice, *just* is also used in the sense of closely or almost, barely or scarcely. Cf.

"A soft Etasian gale

But *just* inspired and gently swelled the sail"—DRYDEN.

"*Just* at the point of death."

Dwelling in the depths of ocean—Living at the bottom of the deep ocean.

Surface—The exterior part ; the upper face. *F. sur* above, *face* face. *L. super* above, *facies* face (*superficies*).

The point of comparison is living at the bottom while thinking that he is living on the surface. A man living at the bottom of the ocean is so much used to water that he can see through it, move through it easily, and is in fact unconscious of the presence of the water itself. Exactly so are we who live at the bottom of the atmosphere that surrounds the earth. The air surrounds the earth to a particular height all round, and we live at the bottom of it. To reach the pure ethereal region we must go up and above the atmospheric surface.

Heaven—The celestial region ; space corresponding to our atmospheric region, (because he was not conscious of the presence of water).

Through the water—Though there existed a medium of water between himself and the heavenly bodies, —the sun and the stars.

Too weak—Had not the necessary amount of strength to enable him to rise to the top or surface of it.

Slow—because his efforts that way could not be sudden.

Lifted his head etc. : The idea is the vision of the sun and the stars to one who dwells at the bottom of the ocean is comparatively more dim than to one who lives at the top of it. Now air is a thinner sediment than water, the heavenly bodies are brighter to us than to a man at the bottom of the sea, and, nevertheless, they are not as bright as they really are. Therefore, to appreciate their real splendour we will have to go up to the top of the atmosphere.

N. B.—The earth consists of a very pure substance. Water, air, etc., are the sediments falling to the bottom of it.

The place wherein he dwelt—The bottom of the ocean he occupies.

In that state—In that condition. The idea is, our condition is exactly like that.

We dwell in a hollow etc.: The idea is we are not conscious of the presence of the air around us. We live in a hollow or a depressed part of the earth, and on account of ignorance we think that we are living on the surface of it.

N. B.—He means to say that just as there are cavities in the earth in which water deposits itself, so the space that is filled up by the atmosphere is to be regarded as another hollow, though, perhaps, we are not conscious of it.

We call the air heaven :—What we call heaven is not heaven actually, but the air that surrounds us. Heaven is above the atmospheric surface.

The stars run their courses—The stars, moreover, have their regular motion. 'Wherein...courses' is to be taken to qualify 'heaven' and not air. The idea is, heaven in which they all rotate etc. *Run*, because of the swiftness with which they move. *Courses* is the adverbial object.

Truth—The true fact ; the actual state of things.

Too weak and slow :—These epithets are used in the case of the man also who is supposed to live at the bottom of the ocean. Here our weakness consists in being unable to go to the top of the atmosphere and is similar to the weakness of that man who is at the bottom of the ocean.

Could reach the surface—Were able to go to the surface of the atmosphere by any means.

Take wings—Have wings ; to put on wings ; use something serving the purpose of wings.

Fly upward, for that is the only way of passing beyond the atmospheric region.

Look up—Direct the eye or look upwards. Notice, *look up* is also used in the sense of rising high or having an upward tendency ; e.g., the price of wheat is *looking up*.

See a world beyond—Catch the view of a world situated on that side.

The fishes—Various kinds of fish.

Behold—See ; catch a glimpse of. The idea is, they live in water, but at the same time they can come to the surface of the water and see the nature of the world above it.

Our World—The world in which we live ; the atmosphere that surrounds the earth and at the bottom of which we live.

He would know—He will be able to know in that case.

Real heaven—Actual celestial region ; the region which can aptly be called the pure celestial region.

Real light—Actual splendour of the heavenly bodies that directly comes to one's view.

Real earth,—Because the earth we know of is but the sediment, and the actual earth cannot be felt here.

His nature—His condition ; the condition of his powers etc.

To endure—To bear ; to tolerate.

The sight—The view. The idea is his weak powers of the eye may not be able to endure the brighter splendour that comes to his view.

N. B.—He now says why such a splendour cannot be seen on the surface of our world. The chief point is, just as brine corrodes things in the sea, so also certain things in the atmosphere spoil all the objects in our world.

Spoilt—Deprived of several good qualities.

Corroded—Impaired ; worn away or diminished by a gradual destruction of the particles. *L. cor* wholly, *rodere* to gnaw.

Brine—Water saturated with salt ; salt water.

Caves—Cavities in the land etc.

Vast tracts—Large parts. *L. tractus* drawing out ; regions.

Mud and slime : *Mud* is earth well mixed with water, and *slime* is soft moist earth or clay which is extremely sticky. Cf.

“As it ebbs, the seedsman
Upon the *slime* and ooze scatters his grain.”—SHAKES.

[PAGE 200.]

Fair things—Things that are not good, but cannot at the same be not regarded as bad.

This shows that the things on our world are not perfect either. They too have been spoilt to some extent, but are not so bad as things in the sea. And the same comparison holds between things here and the things on the real earth.

Other world—The world that comes to our view when we fly to the top of the atmosphere.

Surpass—Excel ; go beyond in the matter of quality. *F. sur* (corresponding to *L. super*), *passer* to pass.

I can tell you a tale : What follows is called a tale, because it is a pure mythological account. But there seems to be little doubt that Plato, at the time of writing it, did believe in it.

Worth : Here it is an adjective meaning deserving of. It is generally used in a good sense. Cf.

“To reign is *worth* ambition, though in hell.”—MILTON.

“This is life indeed, life *worth* preserving.”—ADDISON.

It is also used in the sense of equal in value to. Cf.

“A ring he hath of mine *worth* forty ducats.”—SHAKES.

There is another use of *worth* as a verb which, however, deserves a careful consideration. Cf.

"Woe *worth* the day, woe *worth* the chase,
That cost thy life my gallant grey."—SCOTT.

Worth here is an intransitive verb and in the imperative mood, and is equivalent to *be*, 'woe *worth* the day' meaning, 'woe *be* (to) the day.' *Day* and *chase* in the above quotation are to be parsed as datives. Cf., also,

"Woe is *me*."—*Hamlet*.

Worthen in M. E. meant to become.

LIX.

This is my tale—The tale I have to narrate is as follows.

Could look—Had the power to look upon ; was able to take a view of the actual world.

From above, that is, having gone beyond the region occupied by the sediment.

Is like etc.—Is similar to ; resembles.

Notice the comparison that follows.

Marked, that is, each piece coloured distinctly.

Various colours—Different colours.

Painters—Those who paint or draw pictures in colours.

Here, that is, in our world.

As it were : Notice, *as* here qualifies *so* ; *that* is to be understood. *Were* is in the subjunctive mood. Cf. "See that all *were* in readiness." The sentence would be 'The colours our painters use here are (so) as it (would be if they) were samples.' Care should be taken in analyzing such sentences.

Samples—Specimens ; small quantities of anything intended to be shown or exhibited. It is the same as *ample*.

There—Viewed from that world.

The whole earth—The entire earth-globe.

With them—With those colours.

Far brighter etc : Those colours with which the earth is coloured surpass the corresponding colours we have got in brightness and are also purer in quality.

Than they—Than the colours used by our painters.

Purple—A colour blended of red and blue together.

Marvellous beauty—Exquisite beauty ; beauty which strikes us with astonishment.

Golden—Resembling gold ; beautiful yellow.

White of it etc.—The white colour of it is superior to the white colour with which we are familiar. The colour of chalk and snow is, perhaps, the whitest with which we are familiar, but the white of that is superior to this.

Made up of—Consists of.

Other colours etc.—There are also in it other colours with which we are familiar, but they are all decidedly superior to them.

And also of colours etc. : This shows that there are many other colours there, and though we are not familiar with such here in our world, yet it might be said that they excel every one we have got in their beauty.

The very hollows : Perhaps, he means that just as in our world we find hollows into which water runs, so also from the other world can be seen hollows on earth into which air gets in.

Glisten—Shine bright ; sparkle with light.

Amid—In the midst of. The prefix *a* on, and *mid*.

Diversity—Distinctness ; variety. *N. B.*—It is opposed to *identity*.

Others—Other colours.

One unbroken—A complete and unseparated.

Varied,—Looking separate because of the colours.

The idea is, it is one continuous mass without a fracture, but only differently coloured. Sometimes the hollows filled with air present a deep-shining aspect, and are beautiful indeed, especially as they shine in the midst of other beautiful colours.

Grows—Rises in the earth as a vegetable production.

Fair earth—Earth which is fair or beautiful. It is said *fair*, because of its exquisite beauty compared to ours.

Its trees, and flowers, and fruit—*Trees* are perennial plants consisting of trunks of a considerable size from which there are branches on all sides. Flowers and fruits may not be so very big, and their peculiarity is yielding of flowers and fruits.

Same proportion—Same size etc.

Likewise—In the same manner. *Wise* a suffix indicating manner or direction, is the same as in *lengthwise*, *breadthwise*, etc.

Smoothness—Evenness of the surface.

Transparency—The quality of admitting light through; the quality of objects which enables us to see the objects through them. L. *Trans* across, through, *parcere* to appear.

Pebbles—Transparent and crystalline stones. . A. S. *papol-stan* a pebble-stone. Cf. L. *papula* a pimple, a mote. It generally means a small roundish stone, and especially a stone worn and rounded by the action of water.

Prize—Value highly; estimate to be of great worth. Cf.

"I do love, *prize*, and honour you."—SHAKES.

"I *prized* your person, but your crown disdain."—DRYDEN.

[PAGE 207.]

Our cornelians: *Our* is used impersonally here: It means 'with which we are familiar.' *Your* is often used in

the same sense. Cf. '*your* manner of speech', p. 36, text book. '*Our* world' also means, not the world which belongs to, or is the property of, us, but the world with which we are familiar.

Cornelians (sometimes spelt *cornelians*)—A variety of quartz stones. F. *cornaline*, 'the cornix or cornaline, a flesh-coloured stone.' SKEAT also suggests that *cornelian* is so called because of its resemblance to the fruit of the cornelian tree. It is influenced by L. *carneus* fleshy, because of its flesh red colour.

Jaspers—Another variety of quartz stones. They are opaque, of course impure, of red, yellow, or other dull colours. They admit of a high polish, and are used for vases, seals, snuff-boxes, etc. Sometimes their colours are in stripes or bonds, and are, therefore, called *striped* or *banded* jaspers.

Emeralds—Precious stones of rich green colour.

And the like—And the like precious or valued stones.

Are but fragments—Are only small pieces. L. *fragmentum* a broken piece.

Of them—Of those hills and stones.

By the way, one grammatical peculiarity can be noticed here: Here is the sentence (the epithets being removed), 'The pebbles are but fragments of them'. Some say that *but* is an adverb, a preposition and also a conjunction. In such an example as, 'I have *but* one friend in the world,' *but* may be taken as an adverb equivalent to *only*, and qualifying *one* which is a numeral. But in the other case, *but* cannot be taken as an adverb, for though it can qualify *fragments* it cannot be connected with it. It might, however, be taken as a preposition governing *fragments*. But instead of this which looks rather peculiar, others propose that the sentence is an elliptical one, and in its full form it should be, 'The pebbles are (nothing) but (it be that they are) fragments of them.' *But*, in this case, retains its full significance of marking opposi-

tion. *But* being originally *butan*, A.S. *be* by, *utan* (adv.) without. Hence the explanation of the sentence is, 'leaving out the fact that they are fragments etc., they are nothing'

N. B.—"The chief error with *but* is to use it where *and* is enough; an error springing from the tendency to use strong words without sufficient occasion."—BAIN.

But there—On the other hand in that celestial region.

All the stones etc.—All the stones that are found there as beautiful and rich as our precious stones.

Precious stones—Gems; stones in nature but precious on account of their quality.

N. B.—Here is given a reason for the difference in value between the stones found on our earth, and the stones found on the real earth. On account of the air, all our stones here, though naturally ought to have been as precious as those stones there, are corroded, and thus sink in value.

Decay—Gradual wearing away; falling into ruin. L. *de* down, *cadere* to fall.

Sediment—Such as water, air, etc., that collect in the hollows. L. *sedere* to sit, settle. L. *sedimentum* a settling (of dregs).

Collects—Deposits itself. L. *col*, with *legere* to gather.

Deformity—Disfiguring; The quality of being ugly and unpleasant.

Disease—Unsound condition; a condition of ill-health. The idea is that on account of deformity, all the beauty is lost, and on account of disease, they gradually wear away and perish.

All these things—All these precious stones, etc.

And with them—As well as; in addition with.

Gold and silver and the like—Precious metals. The idea is, there are precious metals as well as precious stones.

Adorn—Decorate; beautify. L. *ad* to, *ornare* to adorn.

Conspicuous—Prominent; eminent. L. *con*, *specio* to see.

Happy man, because he will free himself from the causes of deformity and disease to which we are subject here.

Inland—Interior; remote from the sea.

Round the air—All around the coast of a hollow which is filled by air.

Islands: The *s* is inserted by a confusion with F. *isle*. M. E. *iland*, A. S. *igland*, *ig* an island, *land* land.

Continent—A large geographical division of earth. What he means to say is there are oceans of air above with islands, and people live on such islands, on the coasts of such seas, and towards the interior of the land also, in that real earth.

In a word—Without much dilation. The idea is their air is ether and their water is our air.

Temperature—The degree of heat etc. in the weather.

Seasons are divisions of the year according to certain astronomical conditions. In the West, however, the year is divided into four seasons, the astronomical basis for which is the increasing or the decreasing of the day. From that day (March 23) on which the day and night are of equal length up to the day on which the day is longest is called spring; from the longest day to the day on which day and night are of equal length it is called summer; a period subsequent to it till the day is shortest is called autumn; and commencing from that day on which the day is shortest up to the day on which the day and night are again equal, it is called winter.

N. B.—This suggests that the seasons of those that dwell on the real earth is subject to less extremes of heat and cold, and that makes people there to be more healthy and live for a longer period than we do here.

Sight, hearing, etc. : There are five sensory organs, the organ of sight (eye), the organ of hearing (ear), the organ of smell (nose), the organ of taste (tongue), and the organ of touch (skin). What he means to say is that these organs of those men are keener than ours.

Sanctuaries—Places consecrated for holy purposes.

Temples—Buildings consecrated for deities.

Dwell—Live ; stay.

In very truth—In their actual body.

Voices—Speeches.

In vision, that is, they will have an actual sight of them.

Intercourse—Moving with them for any purpose.

Face to face—Directly ; not in an indirect way as we do here.

N. B.—This shows that the idea of godhead in ancient Greece was personal. They were, so to speak, certain superior beings inhabiting better regions, and it was possible for men who have risen high from their surroundings to have free intercourse with them and enjoy their company.

As they really are—In their actual condition ; not less bright etc., as is the case with ours.

A piece : Notice the use of *piece* here. It means something conceived of as apart from other things of the same kind. The idea is that it is also happiness inasmuch as that it resembles our happiness in particular ways, but is distinct from it when its extent etc. is taken into consideration.

LX.—THE INFERNAL REGIONS.

Nature—The essential quality which constitutes it as it is.

As a whole—Our earth and the real earth put together.

On its globe—On its spherical surface.

Regions—Tracts of land.

Narrow mouths—Openings that are not very broad. *Mouth* is an opening through which animals take in food, and it hence came to be used also in the sense of an opening affording entrance or exit.

Again—On the other hand. Notice this use of the word. Cf.

"The one is my sovereign.....and the other *again* my kinsman."—SHAKES.

Shallower and broader: Notice the contrast with *deeper, but narrower*.

Connected—Joined together. L. *con* together, *nectere* to bind.

Channels beneath the earth—Channels beneath the surface of the earth; subterranean passages of water.

Pas ages—Courses (through which water flow).

Basins—Reservoirs etc., to hold water.

Never failing rivers—Rivers in which there is always water.

Both hot and cold water etc.: That is to say, there are two sorts of rivers beneath the earth, and some of these contain hot water and others cold water.

Much fire: A huge fire is also believed to be present beneath the earth.

Rivers of fire—Streams in which fire flows; rivers which contain liquid fire.

Liquid mud—Mud or earth which has been liquefied on account of excessive heat. *L. liqueo* to melt.

Some clearer etc. : Some are pure and crystalline as they contain little or no sediment, while others are turbid as they do contain morbid matter.

Turbid—Foul with extraneous matter; having the sediment disturbed. *L. turbidus*, from *turba* a crowd, or *turbare* to trouble. *Trouble* is also from the same root. Thus the word means holding sediment in a disturbed condition.

Rivers of mud—Currents which flow actual mud.

Precede—Occur before. *L. pre* before, and *cede* I go.

Lava stream—Stream of molten rock. Lava is the molten rock ejected by a volcano from its top or fissured sides. It flows in streams sometimes miles in length. It also issues from fissures in the earth's surface, and forms beds covering many square miles.

Sicily—An island of that name in the Mediterranean.

Thus what he says to be contained inside the earth are: (1) water channels; (2) rivers flowing hot and cold water; (3) fire; (4) streams of fire; (5) liquid mud; and (6) lava streams.

N. B.—The next thing that is said is that just as water runs in the form of rivers to a sea, so they also flow and fill a hollow and give it an appearance of an ocean. Also in the same manner in which water is changing its place, that is, flowing into the sea, taking another course, and coming back to the rivers again, these various things are constantly changing their places inside the earth.

Flows round : *Round*, from one place to another.

Up and down—To and fro; this way and that.

Oscillation—A change back and forth.

Which is in the earth—Which is present in the earth. The idea is there is present in the earth an oscillating motion by which these things are moving back and forth.

Natural cause—A cause that is self-adjusting ; a cause that is not artificial : a thing that produces effects in the very order of nature.

Kind—Sort.

Chasms—Clefts ; deep openings. They seem to come into existence on account of disruptions that may naturally take place. L. *chasma* a gulf ; Gr. *chasma*, a yawning cleft. It is allied to *chaos*.

Others—Other chasms.

Through it—Through the earth.

Homer : See above.

Far away—Removed a very great distance from us.

The deepest depth—The deepest of all such chasms.

Beneath the earth—Within the earth ; *beneath*, because it is beneath the place we occupy. (Notice, all these things are described as contained in the earth itself).

Elsewhere—In some other place. That is to say, though he does not mention the name of Tartarus here, yet he does so in some other place.

Many others of the poets—Many others from among the poets. That is, many other poets. The slight distinction between the two phrases may be noticed : *others of the poets* means 'there are several poets of whom some etc.,' while *other poets*, 'others who are poets.'

Have called it—Have given it the name of.

Tartarus—That part of the infernal regions where the wicked are punished.

Tartarus is the Latin spelling, the Greek one being *Tartaros*.

Two other names should be noticed in this connection: *Hades* (two syllables) are the places of the departed spirits till resurrection. It may be either Paradise or *Tartarus*. *Gehenna* (*g* hard) is the place of eternal torment. Strictly speaking, it means simply the valley of Hinnom (*Ge-Hinnom*) where sacrifices to Moloch were offered and where refuse of all sorts was subsequently cast, for the consumption of which fires were kept constantly burning. Cf.

"And made his grove
The pleasant valley of Hinnom Tophet thence
And black Gehenna called, the type of hell."

—MILTON : *Paradise Lost*, i, 403-5.

It is a great pity, says an authority, that it has been translated "hell" nine or ten times in the common version of the New Testament, as "hell" in theology means the inferno. The Hebrew *sheol* is about equal to the Greek *haides*, that is, a privative, and *idein* to see. It is a very great pity, says the same authority elsewhere, that the three words (*Tartaros*, *Hades*, and *Gehenna*) are translated alike, especially as *Gehenna* and *Hades* are not synonymous, nor should either be confounded with *Tartarus*. The A. S. verb *hel-an* means to cover, and hence *hell*=the grave or *Hades*.

Out of it again—On account of the oscillation in the earth.

[PAGE 203.]

To be like—To be similar to ; to be of the same quality as.

Liquid—Watery substance. L. *liquere* to be clear.

Bottom or base : This is from the fact that liquids have no shape of their own, and much less bottom.

Surges—Roils like waves.

Up and down—From one side to the other.

Air and wind : Air is the gaseous atmosphere around us, and wind is the air in motion.

N. B.—Liquids and gases included under one common name, *fluids*, and obey certain common laws. Both of them have no shape, and Socrates means to say that they are constantly moving and have no rest.

They accompany it : *They*, that is, air and wind, *it, liquid*.

Breathing—Respiration.

Exhaled—Breathed out. *L. ex* out, *halare* to breathe.

Inhaled—Breathed in. *L. in* in, *halare* to breathe.

N. B.—Respiration consists of two processes, inhalation and exhalation. Air is constantly going in and coming out.

Oscillating with water—Moving from one side to the other with water.

Terrible—Strong in force ; causing fear. *L. terrere* to frighten.

Irresistible—That cannot be resisted or checked ; that cannot be withstood. *L. re* back, *sistere* to stand.

Blasts—Gusts of wind blowing violently. Probably from the same root as the *E. blow*. Cf.

“And see where surly winter passes off,
Far to the north, and calls his ruffian *blasts* ;
His *blasts* obey, and quit the howling hill.”—THOMSON.

Retires—Goes back ; withdraws. *L. re* back, *tirer* to pull.

Rush—Moving forward with rapidity and force ; violent motion.

Lower parts—Lower regions.

As if it were pumped, that is to say, with some force.

Hither—To this place ; to this earth of ours from those lower regions.

Streams here—The rivers on our earth.

The channels of the earth—The subsoil pipes.

Make their way—Find their way ; find their course to.

Create—Bring to existence.

Seas : *sea* signifies a large body of salt water much less than an ocean. It is not used in its strict geographical sense here, but simply means huge bodies of salt water that are found on earth. The only salt water body that seems to have been familiar to the Greeks in those days was the Mediterranean (see II. 19-24, p. 198, text book.) Therefore, there cannot have been such a distinction made between oceans and seas.

Lake—A huge mass of fresh water. A sea is almost generally connected with the ocean, but a lake is isolated and is situated in the midst of land. A lake often, though rarely, consists of salt water, perhaps owing to the salt beds with which they are directly or indirectly in contact.

Rivers—Are natural streams of fresh water seen flowing from a higher region to a lower one on our earth, till the whole flood mouths itself into the sea.

Springs—Places where water issues from beneath ; natural fountains.

N. B.—All these four are fed by the channels inside the earth.

Circuit—A round about course ; a going round. *L. circum* round, *ire* to go.

Regions—Parts of the earth.

Some...fewer—Some making a shorter circuit through fewer regions. Notice the contrast.

Tartarus—The infernal region, which is referred to as the lower part above.

Some at a point etc. : The idea is that if a river has taken a long course, then it falls deep into the Tartarus,

and if its course is comparatively shorter, then it falls to a less depth. See *as low down etc.*, below.

They all flow in below etc.—(But one thing is certain, that is,) they all flow etc.

Burst forth—Rush out with a violent force.

Others again—Other rivers, on the other hand. Notice some burst forth on the very side on which they enter while other ones on the opposite side, and thus there are two different phenomena.

Completely encircle—Go round completely, that is to say, take a complete circle round the earth.

Twining round—Making turns ; winding round. Cf.

“As rivers though they bend and *twine*,
Still to the sea their course incline.”—SWIFT.

Like snakes—Just as snakes coil once or more than once.

Once or perhaps oftener—Completely encircling the earth once or more than once. The idea is there are three kinds of rivers, (1) those that traverse only a part of the surface of the earth ; (2) those that take a complete round, though in a zig-zag way, about the earth ; and (3) those that take more than one round about the earth. Though this, perhaps, looks quite strange to a student of geography, it must, nevertheless, be conceived and realized in the light of the explanation that is offered in the mythological account itself.

As low down etc. : The idea is, the longer the course is of a river, the deeper does it fall into the Tartarus.

[PAGE 204.]

Descend—Go down. Literally, it means to climb down ; i. e. *de* down, *scandere* to climb.

As far as the centre of the earth : A thing in its fall into the earth can only go as far as its centre, for there it loses all its force that would have helped it to move in the same direction. Notice this idea was known to the Greeks already.

From either side—Whether it falls in from one point, or another point on the surface of the earth diametrically opposite to the first.

No farther—Not any more in that direction.

Uphill—Upwards ; in an ascending direction. The idea is that having reached that point at most they will have to take an upward course.

LXI. THE FOUR PARTICULAR RIVERS OF THE INFERNAL REGIONS.

These streams—The rivers that are thus described.

Various—Different. *L. vari-us* variegated, diverse, manifold. *Ous*, of course, is the suffix.

Greatest, because of its length and vastness.

Outermost—That which is on the extreme external part.

Oceanus—Ocean ; the great stream supposed to encompass the earth. *Gr. okeanos* ocean, sometimes, the deity of the ocean.

Opposite—On the other side of. *L. op-(ob)* against. *E. poser* to place.

Reverse direction—Direction which is contrary to that of the Oceanus.

Acheron—The River of Sorrows.

It is thus a river of the infernal regions. It is sometimes taken to mean the infernal regions themselves. By some of the English poets it was taken to be a flaming lake or gulf. MILTON, however, has

“Sad *Acheron* of sorrow, black and deep.”—*Paradise Lost*, ii, 578.

Runs through—Courses itself through ; has its bed through.

Desert places—Barren tracts incapable of supporting population.

Under the earth—Within the earth.

Acherusian lake—A lake situated in the cavern on borders of Pontus, said to lead down to the infernal regions. It was through this cavern that Hercules dragged Cerberus to earth, Cerberus was a three-headed dog of the infernal regions. Cf.

“ The Nem’ean lion first he killed, then Lerne’s hydra slew ;
Th’ Arcadian stag and monster boar before Eurystheus drew ;
Cleansed Augres’ stalls, and made the birds from Lake Stymphalis flee ;

The Cretan bull, and Thracian mares, first seized and then set free ;

Took prize the Amazonian belt, brought Ger’ions kine from Gādēs ;

Fetched apples from the Hesperidēs and *Cerberos* from Hādes.

N. B.—The above lines describe the twelve labours of Hercules.

Generally—In almost all cases ; not absolutely.

Abiding—Awaiting ; having spent the interval. *A. S. a*, prefix, *bidan* to bide.

Appointed time—The time settled in the case of individuals.

For some—In the case of some souls.

Others—Other souls.

The idea is that the time they have to stay there is shorter or longer according to the deserts of the souls.

Sent forth—Sent away ; ordered to go back.

Animals—Living beings. *L. anima* breath.

Between these two : The Oceanus and Acheron rise at opposite extremities, and this third river which will just be named takes its source in some intermediate place.

Source—The origin of a river ; the place where a river takes its rise.